

Appendix C

Appendix C
Examples of Google Employees Spoliating Chats

Ex. #	Document Bates	Custodian/ WITNESS Requesting or Permitting History Off	Date of Chat	Chat Excerpt	Custodians/ WITNESSES Involved (custodian date; hold date)
4X	GOOG-AT- MDL- 007610074	Amin Charaniya	9/23/2022	<p>acharaniya@google.com 2022-09-23T01:23:58.401Z btw didnt realize history is on for us acharaniya@google.com 2022-09-23T01:24:02.913Z mind if i turn it off? hsnair@google.com 2022-09-23T01:24:10.549Z sure [end of chat]</p>	Amin Charaniya custodian: 1/15/2021 hold: 2/3/2021
4W	GOOG-AT- MDL- 007857170	Anthony Chavez	6/10/2022	<p>aschavez@google.com 2022-06-10T03:33:38.162Z separate topic - this chat room has history / is persisted? . . . can we configure it to be transient? . . . vinaygoel@google.com 2022-06-10T03:39:19.589Z if its not doable, are folks okay with a group chat? the benefit? no history. The con? No threads. . . . Kevin and I just tried testing it out. We can't within a Space aschavez@google.com 2022-06-10T03:40:40.053Z that's a bumner . . . my sense is we deal with a group chat? though I am in some spaces that have no history (though maybe not multi threading) . . . vinaygoel@google.com 2022-06-10T03:44:18.223Z okay, let me create a new one right now. It'll still be a space. aschavez@google.com 2022-06-10T03:44:24.242Z cool - ty [end of chat]</p>	Anthony Chavez custodian: 2/20/2020 hold: 1/22/2021 Marshall Vale custodian (TX): 1/14/2021 hold: 1/21/2021

4R	GOOG-AT-MDL-008836562	WOOJIN KIM	11/4/2021	<p>woojink@google.com 2021-11-04T16:39:15.556Z can you turn off history?</p> <p>woojink@google.com 2021-11-04T16:39:40.559Z and could you add katie kurtz pls</p> <p>gomes@google.com 2021-11-04T16:50:51.761Z Added Katie - if you have threading, then history is on, so this is basically like email.</p> <p>[end of chat]</p>	<p>WOOJIN KIM custodian: 8/3/2020 hold: 1/22/2021</p> <p>Benedict Gomes custodian (CID only): 11/20/2019 hold: unknown</p>
4L	GOOG-AT-MDL-010087323	Amin Charaniya	1/27/2021	<p>dardelean@google.com 2021-01-28T17:00:49.832Z cool. btw - this group is on record . . . we should kill it and create one that is single threaded and off the record</p> <p>srireddy@google.com 2021-01-28T17:01:40.628Z not sure why - yes good pt!</p> <p>...</p> <p>dardelean@google.com 2021-01-28T17:47:25.960Z who is in charge with creating this room? I really feel super uncomfortable us continuing this on the record</p> <p>...</p> <p>touma@google.com 2021-01-28T17:56:53.355Z im gonna create a new room and kill this one</p> <p>...</p> <p>dardelean@google.com 2021-01-28T17:57:19.593Z sorry I copied everyone into a new room . . . let's stop using this one</p> <p>[end of chat]</p>	<p>Amin Charaniya custodian: 1/15/2021 hold: 2/3/2021</p> <p>Christophe Combette custodian: 5/26/2023 hold: 6/12/2023 (took over for another custodian 2020)</p>
4S	GOOG-AT-MDL-010366478	Danielle Romain	11/10/2021	<p>yvettehc@google.com 2021-11-10T18:15:58.284Z ok for me to keep history on here? need to keep some info for memory purposes</p> <p>dromain@google.com 2021-11-10T18:34:34.134Z Yvette, unfortunately, I'm not supportive of turning history on. The discussion that started this thread gets into legal and potentially competitive territory, which I'd like to be conscientious of having under privilege. So that you're aware, when history is on, it's discoverable. Sometimes that's totally fine but I'd like to stick to the default of history off. Thanks</p> <p>[end of chat]</p>	<p>Danielle Romain custodian: 2/20/2020 hold: 1/22/2021</p>

4E	GOOG-AT-MDL-010699441	BONITA STEWART	4/8/2020	<p>Bonita Stewart , 2020-04-08 13:06:12 btw you might want to turn your chat history off</p> <p>Jason Washing , 2020-04-08 13:06:21 geez . . . for sure! . . . thank you! [end of chat]</p>	<p>BONITA STEWART custodian: 11/20/2019 hold: 10/4/2019</p> <p>Jason Washing custodian: 7/9/2021 hold: 1/22/2021</p>
4P	GOOG-AT-MDL-010777654	APARNA PAPPU	6/10/2021	<p>mchasan@google.com 2021-06-11T00:41:39.289Z Please keep history off on this legally sensitive chat room</p> <p>apappu@google.com 2021-06-11T00:45:30.150Z @Mike Chasan who all have we debriefed in legal? [end of chat, other than updates to "room membership"]</p>	<p>APARNA PAPPU custodian: 8/3/2020 hold: 1/22/2021</p> <p>JIM GILES custodian: 8/3/2020 hold: 1/22/2021</p>
4U	GOOG-AT-MDL-011236786	MARTIN PAL	12/15/2021	<p>mpal@google.com December 15, 2021 at 8:36:59 PM UTC Hope it's OK to have chat history on . . .</p> <p>tris@google.com December 15, 2021 at 9:13:26 PM UTC We want chat history on? I would generally prefer for us to keep history off. Is there a strong reason to keep this on? . . .</p> <p>cilvento@google.com December 15, 2021 at 9:32:31 PM UTC I think history is on at this point . . . But we'll turn it off now as discussed</p> <p>mpal@google.com December 15, 2021 at 9:32:40 PM UTC let's turn it off then [end of chat]</p>	<p>MARTIN PAL custodian: 5/18/2023 hold: 1/22/2021</p>
4O	GOOG-AT-MDL-011693260	Roshan Khan	3/5/2021	<p>Roshan Khan , 2021-03-05 07:21:19 Let's figure our position then we can figure out who does the work. Unclear to me best place</p> <p>Roshan Khan , 2021-03-05 07:22:43 Can you turn history off . . . Otherwise let's chat in Vcs [end of chat]</p>	<p>Roshan Khan custodian: 1/15/2021 hold: 1/22/2021</p>

4V	GOOG-AT-MDL-012246761	Vip Andleigh	2/1/2022	<p>vip@google.com 2022-02-02T21:33:44.206Z holy moly. FB down 23% in afterhours . . . I'd also assume engagement is weakening on the core app and hurting their cross-platform measurement products, etc.</p> <p>. . .</p> <p>dyc@google.com 2022-02-02T21:37:04.738Z Took a quick glance at the press release. . . . They say it's on both pricing and impression deceleration. They are blaming a shift to Reels (lower CPM than stories and news feed) and ATT. . . .</p> <p>. . .</p> <p>brownadam@google.com 2022-02-02T21:51:01.685Z The other factor I'd throw out there is increased competition.</p> <p>. . .</p> <p>craigma@google.com 2022-02-02T23:04:14.429Z Also, suggest we turn off history since there is no business need for it unless anyone feel strongly against [end of chat]</p>	Vip Andleigh custodian: 8/3/2020 hold: 1/22/2021
4J	GOOG-AT-MDL-014680318	Vidhya Srinivasan	10/29/2020	<p>Christophe Combette , 2020-10-29 10:08:09 do you know if our pings are privileged / discoverable?</p> <p>Vidhya Srinivasan , 2020-10-29 10:08:39 we should turn history off [end of chat]</p>	Vidhya Srinivasan custodian: 2/20/2020 hold: 1/22/2021 Christophe Combette custodian: 5/26/2023 hold: 6/12/2023
4C	GOOG-AT-MDL-018356212	Prabhakar Raghavan	3/3/2020	<p>sundar@google.com 2020-03-03T16:16:47.476Z We can have everyone join at noon</p> <p>pragh@google.com 2020-03-03T16:18:35.601Z Let's decide at noon whether to recreate as a History off group chat</p> <p>pragh@google.com 2020-03-03T16:19:27.562Z The chat within video meetings loses history when the call ends I believe, but I'll confirm [end of chat]</p>	Prabhakar Raghavan custodian: 11/20/2019 hold: 10/4/2019 Sundar Pichai custodian: 11/20/2019 hold: 10/4/2019
4D	GOOG-AT-MDL-018356213	Prabhakar Raghavan	3/3/2020	<p>pragh@google.com 2020-03-03T16:32:40.586Z ok team false start - by the IRC semantics of chat Rooms, History remains ON - so I'm going to kill this room and re-create as a group chat with History OFF. sorry about that</p>	Prabhakar Raghavan custodian: 11/20/2019 hold: 10/4/2019

4I	GOOG-AT-MDL-018491727	Vidhya Srinivasan	10/6/2020	<p>vids@google.com 2020-10-06T17:48:31.936Z pls turn off history</p> <p>lawrencechang@google.com 2020-10-06T17:49:35.187Z oh i see. let's be careful there, karthik.</p> <p>acharaniya@google.com 2020-10-06T17:51:49.886Z touma has some extension that keeps turning history on</p> <p>touma@google.com 2020-10-06T17:52:36.119Z it's probably easier to remove me from the chat group while i find the extension</p> <p>[end of chat]</p>	<p>Vidhya Srinivasan custodian: 2/20/2020 hold: 1/22/2021</p> <p>Amin Charaniya custodian: 1/15/2021 hold: 2/3/2021</p>
4N	GOOG-AT-MDL-019389207	Vip Andleigh	2/10/2021	<p>dallsopp@google.com 2021-02-10T21:57:32.850Z Can we also keep the info confidential to this group? . . .</p> <p>vip@google.com 2021-02-10T21:59:28.472Z lets keep confi, we can also turn off history. if i see something important, i'll note it down somewhere</p> <p>. . .</p> <p>dallsopp@google.com 2021-02-10T22:00:07.333Z I also dont know how to turn history on... . . .</p> <p>https://docs.google.com/presentation/d/1kG1CYAotgeV-NGwB3ZWifT-Z8eobOnNBqEAGzAfeHBM/edit#slide=id.gbb0c393bc6_0_0 . . .</p> <p>Proposal for rebooting Planning, starting by bold objectives outline by team. Next step is fleshing out headwinds, using Finance "risk Log" as a starting point. I'll share w/ this group once I have it.</p> <p>crhyu@google.com 2021-02-11T15:58:36.668Z Thanks Dale this is really helpful to see. . . .</p> <p>dallsopp@google.com 2021-02-11T16:12:15.008Z not final. will respond shortly. closing meeting</p> <p>[end of chat]</p>	<p>Vip Andleigh custodian: 8/3/2020 hold: 1/22/2021</p>
4A	GOOG-AT-MDL-B-003992377	NITISH KORULA (requested by in-house counsel, Uchechi Okereke)	11/12/2019	<p>Nitish Korula , 2019-11-12 12:59:25 Curt, Jonathan: Can we preserve old DT files from the last 60 days</p> <p>Curt Harting , 2019-11-12 12:59:35 Talked to Chech now</p> <p>. . .</p> <p>Uchechi Okereke , 2019-11-12 12:59:49 Please can we turn history off?</p> <p>[end of chat]</p>	<p>NITISH KORULA custodian: 2/16/2021 hold: 10/4/2019</p>

4G	GOOG-AT-MDL-B-004008622	CHRIS LASALA	8/18/2020	<p>Chris LaSala, 2020-08-18 13:01:59 do you know how much buy-side changes are because of &#39;efficiency&#39; . . . vs decreased win rate . . . because if a big part is decreased win rate, we&#39;d expect buyside to adjust . . . so the loss will come back</p> <p>Nash Islam , 2020-08-18 13:02:53 dont know but will look into. good q . . .</p> <p>Chris LaSala , 2020-08-18 13:03:18 also, maybe start an off the record ping thread with Duke,you, me . . . about this . . . and lets the 3 of us get on the same page . . . about what, if anything, we (sell-side) should do about it</p> <p>Nash Islam , 2020-08-18 13:03:57 k kicking off now [end of chat]</p>	<p>CHRIS LASALA custodian: 2/20/2020 hold: 1/22/2021</p> <p>DUKE DUKELLIS custodian: 2/20/2020 hold: 1/22/2021</p>
4Q	GOOG-AT-MDL-B-004073824	Sundar Pichai (CEO)	10/12/2021	<p>sundar@google.com October 12, 2021 at 4:53:16 AM UTC Need the link for my leaders circle tomorrow</p> <p>sundar@google.com October 12, 2021 at 4:53:28 AM UTC also can we change the setting of this group to history off [discussion of linked draft document]</p>	<p>Sundar Pichai custodian: 11/20/2019 hold: 10/4/2019</p>
4B	GOOG-AT-MDL-B-004309756	BONITA STEWART	12/3/2019	<p>Bonita Stewart , 2019-12-03 11:40:29 fyi. on your chats you have the history turned on. we are advised to turn history off so messages are cleared after 24 hours</p> <p>Cyrus Beagley , 2019-12-03 11:41:50 oh i didn&#39;t know that -- i&#39;ve turned it on so i don&#39;t lose messages! I&#39;ll turn it off then... [end of chat]</p>	<p>BONITA STEWART custodian: 11/20/2019 hold: 10/4/2019</p>

4T	GOOG-AT-MDL-B-004468047	Adam Juda	11/17/2021	<p>wendyklogan@google.com November 17, 2021 at 1:16:39 AM UTC Adding Aysun, who is excited to drive and coordinate this effort from a Business Strategy perspective. Welcome</p> <p>...</p> <p>juda@google.com November 17, 2021 at 2:43:40 PM UTC What is the history status of this group?</p> <p>wendyklogan@google.com November 17, 2021 at 8:33:57 PM UTC Given it's a thread chat room, we cannot turn history off and chat retention is 18 months. https://support.google.com/info-gov/answer/9366391</p> <p>wendyklogan@google.com November 17, 2021 at 8:34:34 PM UTC We can pivot to group chat with history off -- or --- keep the current setup and only reserve this space for non-sensitive discussions</p> <p>...</p> <p>juda@google.com November 17, 2021 at 8:38:27 PM UTC My preference is history off</p> <p>wendyklogan@google.com November 17, 2021 at 9:07:09 PM UTC sounds good. Will pivot to Google Chat vs. Google Spaces [end of chat]</p>	Adam Juda custodian: 2/20/2020 hold: 1/22/2021
4H	GOOG-DOJ-AT-01828942	CHRIS LASALA	9/16/2020	<p>Nash Islam , 2020-09-16 07:54:22 Should i send an email to Duke & Naomi right now on this? . . . &quot;Per discussion with Spero & his feedback from PS, we should avoid direct mentions of sign-in and email consent in our MSA to align with the negotiating strategy where we will not be specific about our alternative approach for measurement and attribution&quot;</p> <p>Nash Islam , 2020-09-16 07:56:23 or too sensitive for email so keep on ping?</p> <p>Chris LaSala , 2020-09-16 07:58:32 start a ping with history turned off . . . duke, naomi, alex, me</p> <p>Nash Islam , 2020-09-16 07:59:33 k [end of chat]</p>	<p>CHRIS LASALA custodian: 2/20/2020 hold: 1/22/2021</p> <p>DUKE DUKELLIS custodian: 2/20/2020 hold: 1/22/2021</p>

4F	GOOG-AT-MDL-008384936	Adam Juda	8/8/2020	<p>nazli@google.com 2022-08-08T15:55:38.064Z Adding all the invitees from the war room</p> <p>...</p> <p>juda@google.com 2022-08-08T17:22:45.678Z so it's no longer a Tech-only meeting? . . . Also, I see that History is on in this chat. If that can't be changed, can I please be removed from this discussion?</p> <p>tinawayand@google.com 2022-08-08T17:25:36.294Z today includes GPL - we need advertiser feedback.</p> <p>nazli@google.com 2022-08-08T17:25:40.284Z agreed lets remove [end of chat]</p>	<p>Adam Juda custodian: 2/20/2020 hold: 1/22/2021</p> <p>Marcel Crasmaru custodian: 1/15/2021 hold: 2/3/2021</p>
4M	GOOG-AT-MDL-018491736	Prabhakar Raghavan (in-house counsel Ted Lazarus was also on the chat)	1/27/2021	<p>pragh@google.com 2021-01-27T17:38:56.017Z related to this apple privacy discussion, from today's NYT: "The result is that the data practices of Apple's apps are less upfront. If Apple wants to lead the privacy conversation, it can set a better example by making language clearer — and its labeling program less self-serving. When I asked why all apps shouldn't be held to the same standards, Apple did not address the issue further."</p> <p>cathyedwards@google.com 2021-01-27T17:40:11.298Z I worry that this will be like Apple and China - they are just better at handling this press (and their employees) than we are so won't be so drawn into an ongoing story</p> <p>pragh@google.com 2021-01-27T17:40:38.624Z well then we just need to get a lot better</p> <p>pragh@google.com 2021-01-27T17:47:11.796Z ugh pl stop this chat, for some reason History is on [end of chat]</p>	<p>Prabhakar Raghavan custodian: 11/20/2019 hold: 10/4/2019</p> <p>JERRY DISCHLER custodian: 11/19/2019 hold: 1/22/2021</p> <p>Adam Juda custodian: 2/20/2020 hold: 1/22/2021</p> <p>Rany Ng custodian: 8/3/2020 hold: 1/22/2021</p> <p>Vidhya Srinivasan custodian: 2/20/2020 hold: 1/22/2021</p>

4K	GOOG-AT-MDL-B-004468045	Adam Juda	11/11/2020	John Winfield , 2020-11-11 17:05:43 that's the launch as viewed from aq-launches . . . but, this begs the question: who is on shopping-ads-commerce-headsup . . .if Adam doesn't have access Adam Juda , 2020-11-11 17:07:01 How do we turn History off? I don't do History on [end of chat]	Adam Juda custodian: 2/20/2020 hold: 1/22/2021
----	-------------------------	-----------	------------	--	--