

Appendix D

Chats Involving Custodians on Hold in Which Participants Discussed Turning History “Off”

Bates	Custodian Involved	Chat Date	Hold Date	Chat Excerpt
GOOG-AT-MDL-018279548	Apama Pappu	10/5/2019	10/4/2019	<p>apappu@google.com 2019-05-10T01:17:04.378Z Let’s not use a room there is no history off option apappu@google.com 2019-05-10T01:17:07.728Z Please use group chat instead [REDACTED] 2019-05-10T01:17:56.019Z Yes, please do use history off. Thanks apappu@google.com 2019-05-10T01:18:12.129Z kill this chat room please [REDACTED] 2019-05-10T01:18:16.665Z Ok will do</p>
GOOG-AT-MDL-B003992377	Nitish Korula	11/12/2019	10/4/2019	<p>Nitish Korula, 2019-11-12 12:59:25 [REDACTED]: Can we preserve old DT files from the last 60 days [REDACTED], 2019-11-12 12:59:35 Talked to [REDACTED] now ... [REDACTED], 2019-11-12 12:59:49 Please can we turn history off? [end of chat]</p>
GOOG-AT-MDL-B-004309756	[REDACTED]	12/19/2019	10/4/2019	<p>[REDACTED], 2019-12-03 11:40:29 fyi. on your chats you have the history turned on. we are advised to turn history off so messages are cleared after 24 hours</p>
GOOG-AT-MDL-018356212	[REDACTED]; Sundar Pichai	3/3/2020	10/4/2019	<p>[REDACTED] 2020-03-03T16:16:47.476Z We can have everyone join at noon [REDACTED] 2020-03-03T16:18:35.601Z</p>

Bates	Custodian Involved	Chat Date	Hold Date	Chat Excerpt
				Let's decide at noon whether to recreate as a History off group chat ██████████ 2020-03-03T16:19:27.562Z The chat within video meetings loses history when the call ends I believe, but I'll confirm [end of chat]
GOOG-AT-MDL-018356213	██████████	3/3/2020	10/4/2019	██████████ 2020-03-03T16:32:40.586Z ok team false start - by the IRC semantics of chat Rooms, History remains ON - so I'm going to kill this room and re-create as a group chat with History OFF. sorry about that
NRFSUPP_0001432065	██████████	3/17/2020	12/10/2019	██████████, 2020-03-17 13:17:42 How come you keep turning our history off? ██████████, 2020-03-17 13:17:45 I'm going to keep turning it back on.
GOOG-AT-MDL-010699441	██████████	4/8/2020	10/4/2019	██████████ 2020-04-08 13:06:12 btw you might want to turn your chat history off ██████████, 2020-04-08 13:06:21 geez . . . for sure! . . . thank you! [end of chat]
GOOG-AT-MDL-018279553	Aparna Pappu	7/28/2020	10/4/2019	apappu@google.com 2020-07-28T20:44:15.915Z Hmm I tried creating a room with no history but failed apappu@google.com 2020-07-28T20:44:36.018Z need to ask ██████ if this is some secret hidden dynamite room feature apappu@google.com 2020-07-28T20:47:24.293Z rats my bad i created a threaded room so cant have history off. i will rename this sucker to deprecated and try again

Bates	Custodian Involved	Chat Date	Hold Date	Chat Excerpt
GOOG-AT-MDL-008384936	[REDACTED]	8/8/2020	3/5/2020	<p>[REDACTED] 2022-08-08T15:55:38.064Z Adding all the invitees from the war room ...</p> <p>[REDACTED] 2022-08-08T17:22:45.678Z so it's no longer a Tech-only meeting? . . . Also, I see that History is on in this chat. If that can't be changed, can I please be removed from this discussion?</p> <p>[REDACTED] 2022-08-08T17:25:36.294Z today includes GPL - we need advertiser feedback.</p> <p>[REDACTED] 2022-08-08T17:25:40.284Z agreed lets remove [end of chat]</p>
GOOG-AT-MDL-B-004008623-24	Chris Lasala	8/18/2020	10/4/2019	<p>Chris LaSala, 2020-08-18 13:01:59 do you know how much buy-side changes are because of &#39;efficiency&#39;. . . vs decreased win rate . . . because if a big part is decreased win rate, we&#39;d expect buyside to adjust . . . so the loss will come back</p> <p>Chris LaSala , 2020-08-18 13:03:18 also, maybe start an off the record ping thread with [REDACTED],you, me</p> <p>Chris LaSala , 2020-08-18 13:03:20 about this</p> <p>Chris LaSala , 2020-08-18 13:03:28 and lets the 3 of us get on the same page</p> <p>Chris LaSala , 2020-08-18 13:03:37 about what, if anything, we (sell-side) should do about it</p> <p>[REDACTED] , 2020-08-18 13:03:57 k kicking off now</p>
GOOG-AT-MDL-B-004468114	[REDACTED]	8/25/2020	10/4/2019	<p>[REDACTED] , 2020-08-25 10:18:52 i can&#39;t figure out how to turn history off on our chat</p>

Bates	Custodian Involved	Chat Date	Hold Date	Chat Excerpt
				<p>██████████, 2020-08-25 10:19:01 will explain the spotify &quot;delay&quot; verbally</p>
GOOG-DOJ-AT-01828942-43	Chris Lasala	9/16/2020	10/4/2019	<p>██████████, 2020-09-16 07:54:22 Should i send an email to ██████ & &quot; ██████ right now on this? . . . &quot;Per discussion with ██████ & his feedback from ██████, we should avoid direct mentions of sign-in and email consent in our MSA to align with the negotiating strategy where we will not be specific about our alternative approach for measurement and attribution&quot; ██████████, 2020-09-16 07:56:23 or too sensitive for email so keep on ping? Chris LaSala, 2020-09-16 07:58:32 start a ping with history turned off . . . ██████████, me ██████████ 2020-09-16 07:59:33 k [end of chat]</p>
GOOG-AT-MDL-018491727	██████████	10/6/2020	12/10/2019	<p>██████████ 2020-10-06T17:48:31.936Z pls turn off history ██████████ 2020-10-06T17:49:35.187Z oh i see. let's be careful there, ██████. ██████████ 2020-10-06T17:51:49.886Z has some extension that keeps turning history on ██████████ 2020-10-06T17:52:36.119Z it's probably easier to remove me from the chat group while i find the extension [end of chat]</p>
GOOG-AT-MDL-014680320	██████████	10/29/2020	12/10/2019	<p>██████████, 2020-10-29 10:08:09 do you know if our pings are privileged / discoverable? ██████████, 2020-10-29 10:08:39</p>

Bates	Custodian Involved	Chat Date	Hold Date	Chat Excerpt
				we should turn history off [end of chat]
GOOG-AT-MDL-B-004468042	██████████	11/12/2020	3/5/2020	██████████ November 12, 2020 at 1:07:01 AM UTC How do we turn History off? I don't do History on 🗨
GOOG-AT-MDL-B-004498984	Aparna Pappu	11/30/2020	10/4/2019	Aparna Pappu , 2020-11-30 09:10:33 pinging to remind you re ██████████'s email on counter Aparna Pappu , 2020-11-30 09:11:09 also good god how does one turn history off?
GOOG-AT-MDL-018491736	██████████	1/27/2021	10/4/2019	██████████ 2021-01-27T17:38:56.017Z related to this ██████████ discussion, from today's NYT: "The result is that the data practices of Apple's apps are less upfront. If Apple wants to lead the privacy conversation, it can set a better example by making language clearer — and its labeling program less self-serving. When I asked why all apps shouldn't be held to the same standards, Apple did not address the issue further." ██████████ 2021-01-27T17:40:11.298Z I worry that this will be like ██████████ ██████████ ██████████ 2021-01-27T17:40:38.624Z well then we just need to get a lot better ██████████ 2021-01-27T17:47:11.796Z ugh pl stop this chat, for some reason History is on [end of chat]
GOOG-AT-MDL-B-004498999	Aparna Pappu	2/16/2021	10/4/2019	apappu@google.com February 16, 2021 at 6:37:18 PM UTC [Turned history on to mimic most of our customers] ... ██████████ February 16, 2021 at 7:16:01 PM UTC

Bates	Custodian Involved	Chat Date	Hold Date	Chat Excerpt
				“History off” not being a big deal resonates with me. Google is big time on history-off but others may just let conversations being history on as they treat it as their knowledge base. I will be curious to hear from admins how they treat litigation situations and things talked about in slack channels.
GOOG-AT-MDL-011693260	[REDACTED]	3/5/2021	12/10/2019	[REDACTED], 2021-03-05 07:21:19 Let’s figure our position then we can figure out who does the work. Unclear to me best place [REDACTED], 2021-03-05 07:22:43 Can you turn history off [REDACTED], 2021-03-05 07:22:53 Otherwise let’s chat in Vcs
NRFSUPP_0001154385	[REDACTED]	4/22/2021	2/3/2021	[REDACTED] 2021-04-22T23:45:52.737Z side note, we should turn history off for this chat [REDACTED] 2021-04-22T23:46:29.378Z I cannot figure out/remember how to do that [REDACTED] 2021-04-22T23:50:12.871Z (I am looking and also can not figure out how to do it) [REDACTED] 2021-04-22T23:52:32.697Z i think it’s the type of chatroom, we might need to recreate it [REDACTED] 2021-04-22T23:52:54.353Z I just created a new room, let me invite you all
GOOG-AT-MDL-010777656	Apama Pappu	6/10/2021	1/22/2021	[REDACTED] 2021-06-11T00:41:39.289Z Please keep history off on this legally sensitive chat room apappu@google.com 2021-06-11T00:45:30.150Z @[REDACTED] who all have we debriefed in legal? [end of chat, other than updates to “room membership”]
GOOG-AT-MDL-B-004440060	[REDACTED]	7/27/2021	12/10/2019	[REDACTED] July 27, 2021 at 5:00:20 PM UTC

Bates	Custodian Involved	Chat Date	Hold Date	Chat Excerpt
				<p>Hi all, created this group for us to connect on a more regular basis using chat.</p> <p>██████████ July 27, 2021 at 5:00:29 PM UTC this is actually a room</p> <p>██████████ July 27, 2021 at 5:00:42 PM UTC is history off?</p> <p>██████████ July 27, 2021 at 5:01:35 PM UTC not sure how to tell.</p>
GOOG-AT-MDL-010146303	Apama Pappu	8/19/2021	10/4/2019	<p>██████████ 2021-08-19T18:30:55.914Z That being said... going to create a new Space for this crew (with history off), and I'll re-add the link.</p> <p>apappu@google.com 2021-08-19T19:4022.513Z if history is off then link wont work as in wont be persistent -- if we can keep history on even better</p> <p>██████████ 2021-08-19T19:57:57.397Z very tactical - but for anything M&A related our pref is history off</p>
GOOG-AT-MDL-012219360-61	██████████	9/8/2021	3/5/2020	<p>██████████ 2021-09-08T23:09:27.896Z Just wanted to remind everyone that history is on in the chat.</p> <p>...</p> <p>██████████ 2021-09-09T03:26:59.653Z @██████████ added you to the other chat room. We are converging to a simple plan on the smaller thread, but not all folks are online right now and it's not actually an after-hours fire. Let's keep details/proposals to the other thread where long term history is not on.</p>
GOOG-AT-MDL-008836562	Woojuun Kim	11/4/2021	8/3/2020	<p>woojink@google.com 2021-11-04T16:39:15.556Z can you turn off history?</p> <p>woojink@google.com 2021-11-04T16:39:40.559Z and could you add ██████████ pls</p>

Bates	Custodian Involved	Chat Date	Hold Date	Chat Excerpt
				<p>██████████ 2021-11-04T16:50:51.761Z Added ██████ - if you have threading, then history is on, so this is basically like email. [end of chat]</p>
GOOG-AT-MDL-010366478	██████████	11/10/2021	3/5/2020	<p>██████████ 2021-11-10T18:15:58.284Z ok for me to keep history on here? need to keep some info for memory purposes ☺</p> <p>██████████ 2021-11-10T18:34:34.134Z , unfortunately, I'm not supportive of turning history on. The discussion that started this thread gets into legal and potentially competitive territory, which I'd like to be conscientious of having under privilege. So that you're aware, when history is on, it's discoverable. Sometimes that's totally fine but I'd like to stick to the default of history off. Thanks</p>
GOOG-AT-MDL-B-004468047-49	██████████	11/17/2021	3/5/2020	<p>██████████ November 17, 2021 at 1:16:39 AM UTC Adding ██████, who is excited to drive and coordinate this effort from a Business Strategy perspective. Welcome</p> <p>...</p> <p>██████████ November 17, 2021 at 2:43:40 PM UTC What is the history status of this group?</p> <p>...</p> <p>██████████ November 17, 2021 at 8:33:57 PM UTC Given it's a thread chat room, we cannot turn history off and chat retention is 18 months. https://support.google.com/info-gov/answer/9366391</p> <p>...</p> <p>██████████ November 17, 2021 at 8:34:34 PM UTC</p>

Bates	Custodian Involved	Chat Date	Hold Date	Chat Excerpt
				<p>We can pivot to group chat with history off -- or --- keep the current setup and only reserve this space for non-sensitive discussions</p> <p>...</p> <p>██████████ November 17, 2021 at 8:38:27 PM UTC My preference is history off</p> <p>...</p> <p>██████████ November 17, 2021 at 9:07:09 PM UTC sounds good. Will pivot to Google Chat vs. Google Spaces [end of chat]</p>
GOOG-AT-MDL-011236786-87	██████████	12/15/2021	1/22/2021	<p>██████████ December 15, 2021 at 9:13:26 PM UTC We want chat history on? I would generally prefer for us to keep history off. Is there a strong reason to keep this on?</p> <p>...</p> <p>██████████ December 15, 2021 at 9:32:31 PM UTC I think history is on at this point . . . But we'll turn it off now as discussed</p> <p>██████████ December 15, 2021 at 9:32:40 PM UTC let's turn it off then [end of chat]</p>
GOOG-AT-MDL-012246763-64	██████████	2/1/2022	1/22/2021	<p>██████████ 2022-02-02T21:33:44.206Z holy moly. ██████████ ██████████</p> <p>.....</p> <p>██████████ 2022-02-02T21:37:04.738Z Took a quick glance at the press release. . . . They say it's on both pricing and impression deceleration. They are blaming a shift to Reels (lower CPM than stories and news feed) and ATT. . .</p>

Bates	Custodian Involved	Chat Date	Hold Date	Chat Excerpt
				<p>..... [REDACTED] 2022-02-02T21:51:01.685Z [REDACTED] 2022-02-02T23:04:14.429Z Also, suggest we turn off history since there is no business need for it ☺ unless anyone feel strongly against [end of chat]</p>
NRFSUPP_0000223897	Aparna Pappu	2/13/2022	10/4/2019	<p>[REDACTED] 2022-04-13T16:07:50.699Z I turned on history, hope everyone is ok with it [REDACTED] 2022-04-13T16:07:56.707Z if not happy to turn it off apappu@google.com 2022-04-13T18:15:22.752Z prefer off tbh</p>
GOOG-AT-MDL-007857170-71	[REDACTED]	6/10/2022	1/22/2021	<p>[REDACTED] 2022-06-10T03:33:38.162Z separate topic - this chat room has history / is persisted? . . . can we configure it to be transient? . . . [REDACTED] 2022-06-10T03:39:19.589Z if its not doable, are folks okay with a group chat? the benefit? no history. The con? No threads. . . . Kevin and I just tried testing it out. We can't within a Space [REDACTED] 2022-06-10T03:40:40.053Z that's a bummer . . . my sense is we deal with a group chat? though I am in some spaces that have no history (though maybe not multi threading) . . . [REDACTED] 2022-06-10T03:44:18.223Z okay, let me create a new one right now. It'll still be a space. [REDACTED] 2022-06-10T03:44:24.242Z cool - ty</p>

Bates	Custodian Involved	Chat Date	Hold Date	Chat Excerpt
				[end of chat]
GOOG-AT-MDL-007610075	[REDACTED]	9/23/2022	2/3/2021	[REDACTED] 2022-09-23T01:23:58.401Z btw didnt realize history is on for us [REDACTED] 2022-09-23T01:24:02.913Z mind if i turn it off? [REDACTED] 2022-09-23T01:24:10.549Z sure [end of chat]
NRFSUPP_0001024231	[REDACTED]	2/9/2023	10/4/2019	[REDACTED] February 9, 2023 at 2:09:43 AM UTC should we turn history on or off here? i'm confused [REDACTED] February 9, 2023 at 2:10:31 AM UTC Not sure....I think it's dependent on the individual and whether they are on lit hold? [REDACTED] February 9, 2023 at 2:32:48 AM UTC Last I checked I had 6 lit holds.....thanks for turning it off TT [REDACTED] February 9, 2023 at 2:33:03 AM UTC Jeez [REDACTED] February 9, 2023 at 2:35:15 AM UTC Yikes [REDACTED] February 9, 2023 at 2:35:31 AM UTC When I responded it turned on history again.... [REDACTED] February 9, 2023 at 2:35:54 AM UTC Oh wow [REDACTED] February 9, 2023 at 2:36:12 AM UTC And ya wonder why I communicate less freely than most..... [REDACTED] February 9, 2023 at 2:36:48 AM UTC And I am not seeing an option to turn history off on my side [REDACTED] February 9, 2023 at 2:36:53 AM UTC This is new

Bates	Custodian Involved	Chat Date	Hold Date	Chat Excerpt
				<p>██████████ February 9, 2023 at 3:02:14 AM UTC turned it off, let's see what happens ██████████ February 9, 2023 at 4:03:56 AM UTC Test ██████████ February 9, 2023 at 4:04:12 AM UTC Hmm</p>
NRFSUPP_0001672026	██████████	2/10/2023	6/23/2020	<p>██████████ February 10, 2023 at 6:29:46 PM UTC Do we have a history off version of this room? ██████████ February 10, 2023 at 6:31:18 PM UTC UTC I don't think we can with the current list of audience ██████████ February 10, 2023 at 6:31:53 PM UTC Perhaps a subset of audience? ██████████ February 10, 2023 at 6:32:05 PM UTC (and keep others informed in other was)</p>