

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

USDC SDNY
DOCUMENT
ELECTRONICALLY FILED
DOC #:
DATE FILED: 1/16/2026

-----X
BLAKE LIVELY,

Plaintiff,

-v-

WAYFARER STUDIOS LLC, JUSTIN BALDONI,
JAMEY HEATH, STEVE SAROWITZ, IT ENDS WITH
US MOVIE LLC, MELISSA NATHAN, THE AGENCY
GROUP PR LLC, JENNIFER ABEL,

Defendants.
-----X

24-cv-10049 (LJL)

ORDER

LEWIS J. LIMAN, United States District Judge:

Before the Court are various requests for sealing and unsealing filed by both parties and non-parties regarding materials submitted in connection with: (1) Plaintiff Blake Lively’s (“Lively”) motion for spoliation sanctions against the Wayfarer Parties,¹ *see* Dkt. No. 862; (2) Third-Party Defendant Jonesworks LLC’s (“Jonesworks”) motion for spoliation sanctions against Third-Party Plaintiff Jennifer Abel (“Abel”), *see* Dkt. No. 867; (3) Abel’s motion for conditional summary judgment against Jonesworks, *see* Dkt. No. 938; and (4) the Wayfarer Parties’ motion for summary judgment against Lively, *see* Dkt. No. 952.

Oral argument on the Wayfarer Parties’ motion for summary judgment and Lively’s motion for spoliation sanctions is scheduled for next Thursday, January 22, 2026. The public has a right to attend that argument and to follow along based on the unredacted summary judgment and spoliation materials—that is, to the extent continued sealing of the materials cannot be

¹ The Wayfarer Parties are Wayfarer Studios LLC, Justin Baldoni, Jamey Heath, Steve Sarowitz, It Ends With Us Movie LLC, Melissa Nathan, The Agency Group PR LLC, and Jennifer Abel.

justified. Accordingly, the Court provides the following bottom-line conclusions on the motions for sealing and unsealing so that the parties have sufficient time to appropriately re-redact and re-file the materials before oral argument. The parties who submitted the materials at issue shall re-file them in accordance with this Order by January 21, 2026, at 1:00 PM. The Court will in short order provide a written opinion with its “specific, on the record findings” explaining why continued sealing of certain materials is justified. *See Lugosch v. Pyramid Co. of Onondaga*, 435 F.3d 110, 120 (2d Cir. 2006) (citation omitted).²

The motions of non-parties Isabela Ferrer, Betty B Holdings, LLC, Family Hive, LLC, Sony Pictures Entertainment, and William Morris Endeavor Entertainment, LLC are denied except to the extent that they seek sealing of personally-identifying information (“PII”) and except to the extent that Sony seeks sealing of Ex. 23 filed in support of Defendants’ Motion for Summary Judgment.

The motions of the Wallace Non-Parties, Katherine Case (“Case”) and Breanna Butler Koslow (“Koslow”), the Wayfarer Parties, and Lively are denied in part and granted in part as detailed below. The parties are also directed to refile their respective memoranda of law and Rule 56.1 statements consistent with the rulings in this Order. To the extent that the parties’ memoranda of law and Rule 56.1 statements refer to portions of the documents below that the Court now seals, those references should be redacted as well. To the extent that the Court denies a request to seal material that is also referred to in the memoranda of law and the Rule 56.1 statements, that material should not be redacted.

² These bottom-line conclusions do not resolve requests for sealing regarding Abel’s motion for summary judgment or Jonesworks’ motion for spoliation sanctions, as those materials will not be addressed at oral argument and will accordingly be handled in a subsequent order.

Table A: The Wallace Non-Parties' Proposed Redactions and the Court's Rulings

Exhibit Number	Proposed Basis for Sealing	Court's Ruling
Def. MSJ Ex. 182	PII	Seal pursuant to the Wallace Non-Parties' proposed redactions
Def. MSJ Ex. 183	PII and sensitive financial account information	Seal pursuant to the Wallace Non-Parties' proposed redactions
Def. MSJ Ex. 184	PII	Seal pursuant to the Wallace Non-Parties' proposed redactions
Def. MSJ Ex. 215	Third-party clients or prospective clients	Seal only the Wallace Non-Parties' first proposed redaction on p. 29
Def. MSJ Ex. 216	Third-party clients or prospective clients	Seal only the Wallace Non-Parties' first proposed redaction on p. 29
Def. MSJ Ex. 217	Third-party clients or prospective clients	Seal only the Wallace Non-Parties' first proposed redaction on p. 29
Pl. MSJ Ex. 203	Third-party clients or prospective clients and sensitive, non-public business information	Seal pursuant to the proposed redactions provided by Lively
Pl. MSJ Ex. 208	Third-party clients or prospective clients and sensitive, non-public business information	Seal pursuant to proposed redactions provided by Lively
Pl. MSJ Ex. 209	Third-party clients or prospective clients and sensitive, non-public business information	Seal pursuant to proposed redactions provided by Lively
Pl. MSJ Ex. 210	Third-party clients or prospective clients and sensitive, non-public business information	Seal pursuant to the proposed redactions provided by Lively
Pl. MSJ Ex. 211	Third-party clients or prospective clients and sensitive, non-public business information	Unseal

Exhibit Number	Proposed Basis for Sealing	Court's Ruling
Pl. MSJ Ex. 212	Third-party clients or prospective clients and sensitive, non-public business information	Seal pursuant to the Wallace Non-Parties' proposed redactions
Pl. MSJ Ex. 213	Third-party clients or prospective clients and sensitive, non-public business information	Seal pursuant to the proposed redactions provided by Lively
Pl. MSJ Ex. 214	Third-party clients or prospective clients and sensitive, non-public business information	Seal pursuant to the proposed redactions provided by Lively
Pl. MSJ Ex. 215	Third-party clients or prospective clients and sensitive, non-public business information	Seal pursuant to the Wallace Non-Parties' proposed redactions except for the first message at 8:57 AM and the words "actually dropped" and "Page six" in the message at 9:41 AM
Pl. MSJ Ex. 216	Third-party clients or prospective clients and sensitive, non-public business information	Seal pursuant to proposed redactions provided by Lively
Pl. MSJ Ex. 217	Third-party clients or prospective clients and sensitive, non-public business information	Seal pursuant to proposed redactions provided by Lively
Pl. MSJ Ex. 235	Sensitive financial account information	Seal pursuant to the Wallace Non-Parties' proposed redactions
Pl. MSJ Ex. 236	Third-party clients or prospective clients and sensitive, non-public business information	Seal only the Wallace Non-Parties' second proposed redaction ending the message at 2:30 PM
Pl. MSJ Ex. 247	Third-party clients or prospective clients and sensitive, non-public business information	Unseal
Pl. MSJ Ex. 299	Third-party clients or prospective clients and sensitive, non-public business information	Seal pursuant to proposed redactions provided by Lively

Exhibit Number	Proposed Basis for Sealing	Court's Ruling
Pl. reply in support of her motion for spoliation sanctions, Ex. 63	PII and sensitive financial account information	Seal pursuant to the Wallace Non-Parties' proposed redactions
Pl. reply in support of her motion for spoliation sanctions, Ex. 64	PII and sensitive financial account information	Seal pursuant to the Wallace Non-Parties' proposed redactions
Pl. reply in support of her motion for spoliation sanctions, Ex. 65	PII and sensitive financial account information	Seal pursuant to the Wallace Non-Parties' proposed redactions
Pl. reply in support of her motion for spoliation sanctions, Ex. 66	PII and sensitive financial account information	Seal pursuant to the Wallace Non-Parties' proposed redactions
Pl. reply in support of her motion for spoliation sanctions, Ex. 68	Third-party clients or prospective clients and confidential services information	Unseal

Table B: Case and Koslow's Proposed Redactions and the Court's Rulings³

Exhibit Number	Proposed Basis for Sealing	Court's Ruling
Def. MSJ Ex. 233	Third-party clients or prospective clients and confidential services information	Unseal
Def. MSJ Ex. 236	Third-party clients or prospective clients and confidential services information	Seal pursuant to Case and Koslow's proposed redactions
Pl. MSJ Ex. 192	Third-party clients or prospective clients and confidential services information	Seal pursuant to Case and Koslow's proposed redactions
Pl. MSJ Ex. 194	Third-party clients or prospective clients and confidential services information	Seal pursuant to Case and Koslow's proposed redactions

Table C: The Parties' Proposed Redactions and the Court's Rulings

Exhibit Number	Sealing Proponent	Proposed Basis for Sealing	Court's Ruling
Pl. MSJ Ex. 18	Lively	Third-party privacy interests	Unseal
Pl. MSJ Ex. 19	Lively	Third-party privacy interests	Unseal
Pl. MSJ Ex. 22 (Def. MSJ Ex. 42)	Lively	Third-party privacy interests	Seal pursuant to Lively's proposed redactions
Pl. MSJ Ex. 33	Lively	Non-disclosed financial information	Seal pursuant to Lively's proposed redactions

³ Certain of Case and Koslow's proposed redactions overlap with those made by the Wayfarer Parties and are therefore addressed below in Table C.

Exhibit Number	Sealing Proponent	Proposed Basis for Sealing	Court's Ruling
Pl. MSJ Ex. 81	Lively	Non-disclosed financial information	Seal pursuant to Lively's proposed redactions
Pl. MSJ Ex. 82	Lively	Non-disclosed financial information	Seal pursuant to Lively's proposed redactions
Pl. MSJ Ex. 83	Lively	Non-disclosed financial information	Seal pursuant to Lively's proposed redactions
Pl. MSJ Ex. 84	Lively	Non-disclosed financial information	Unseal
Pl. MSJ Ex. 85	Lively	Non-disclosed financial information	Unseal
Pl. MSJ Ex. 95	Lively	Third-party privacy interests	Unseal
Pl. MSJ Ex. 104	Lively	Third-party privacy interests	Seal pursuant to Lively's proposed redactions
Pl. MSJ Ex. 106	Lively	Third-party privacy interests	Seal pursuant to Lively's proposed redactions
Pl. MSJ Ex. 108	Lively	Third-party privacy interests	Seal pursuant to Lively's proposed redactions
Pl. MSJ Ex. 112	Lively	Third-party privacy interests	Seal pursuant to Lively's proposed redactions

Exhibit Number	Sealing Proponent	Proposed Basis for Sealing	Court's Ruling
Pl. MSJ Ex. 114	Lively	Third-party privacy interests	Seal pursuant to Lively's proposed redactions
Pl. MSJ Ex. 135	Lively	Third-party privacy interests (compensation data)	Seal pursuant to Lively's proposed redactions
Pl. MSJ Ex. 137	Lively	Third-party privacy interests	Unseal
Pl. MSJ Ex. 152	Lively	Third-party privacy interests	Seal pursuant to Lively's proposed redactions
Def. MSJ Ex. 39	Lively	Third-party privacy interests	Seal pursuant to Lively's proposed redactions
Def. MSJ Ex. 45	Lively	Third-party privacy interests	Unseal
Def. MSJ Ex. 47	Lively	Third-party privacy interests	Seal pursuant to Lively's proposed redactions
Def. MSJ Ex. 48	Lively	Third-party privacy interests	Seal pursuant to Lively's proposed redactions
Def. MSJ Ex. 53	Lively	Third-party privacy interests	Seal pursuant to Lively's proposed redactions
Def MSJ Ex. 87	Lively	Third-party privacy interests	Seal pursuant to Lively's proposed redactions

Exhibit Number	Sealing Proponent	Proposed Basis for Sealing	Court's Ruling
Def MSJ Ex. 95	Lively	Third-party privacy interests	Unseal
Def MSJ Ex. 102	Lively	Third-party privacy interests	Unseal
Def. MSJ Ex. 108	Lively	Third-party privacy interests	Seal pursuant to Lively's proposed redactions
Def MSJ Ex. 133	Lively	Third-party privacy interests	Unseal
Def MSJ Ex. 134 (R. 11 Supp. Opp., Ex. A)	Lively	Third-party privacy interests	Unseal except that the name indicated by the parties can be replaced as the Wayfarer Parties suggest
Def MSJ Ex. 135	Lively	Third-party privacy interests	Unseal
Def MSJ Ex. 136	Lively	Third-party privacy interests	Unseal
Def MSJ Ex. 137	Lively	Third-party privacy interests	Unseal
Def MSJ Ex. 146	Lively	Third-party privacy interests	Unseal
Def MSJ Ex. 148	Lively	Third-party privacy interests	Unseal

Exhibit Number	Sealing Proponent	Proposed Basis for Sealing	Court's Ruling
Def. MSJ Ex. 149 (R. 11 Supp. Opp., Ex. B)	Lively	Third-party privacy interests	Unseal
Def. MSJ Ex. 205 (R. 11 Supp. Opp., Ex. F)	Lively	Third-party privacy interests	Unseal
Def. MSJ Ex. 206 (R. 11 EX. H)	Lively	Third-party privacy interests	Unseal
Def. MSJ Ex. 207 (R. 11 Supp. Opp., Ex. C)	Lively	Third-party privacy interests	Unseal
Def. MSJ Ex. 210	Lively	Third-party privacy interests	Unseal
Def. MSJ Ex. 211 (R. 11 Supp. Opp., Ex. I)	Lively	Third-party privacy interests	Unseal
R. 11 Supp. Opp. Ex. D	Lively	Third-party privacy interests	Unseal

Exhibit Number	Sealing Proponent	Proposed Basis for Sealing	Court's Ruling
R. 11 Supp. Opp. Ex. E	Lively	Third-party privacy interests	Unseal
Pl. MSJ Ex. 3	Wayfarer Parties	Reference to non-party complaint	Unseal
Pl. MSJ Ex. 4	Wayfarer Parties	Reference to non-party complaint	Unseal
Pl. MSJ Ex. 47	Wayfarer Parties	Medical information	Seal pursuant to the Wayfarer Parties' proposed redactions
Pl. MSJ Ex. 58	Wayfarer Parties	Identification of (non-party) client of parties or services rendered thereto	Unseal except for the proposed redactions on pp. 24 and 30
Pl. MSJ Ex. 59	Wayfarer Parties	Identification of (non-party) client of parties or services rendered thereto; irrelevant and inflammatory non-party commentary	Seal pursuant to Case and Koslow's proposed redactions
Pl. MSJ Ex. 60	Wayfarer Parties	Non-party and Identification of (non-party) client of parties or services rendered thereto	Seal pursuant to Case and Koslow's proposed redactions
Pl. MSJ Ex. 61	Wayfarer Parties	Identification of (non-party) client of parties or services rendered thereto	Seal pursuant to Case and Koslow's proposed redactions

Exhibit Number	Sealing Proponent	Proposed Basis for Sealing	Court's Ruling
Pl. MSJ Ex. 64	Wayfarer Parties	Identification of (non-party) client of parties or services rendered thereto	Seal pursuant to both the Wayfarer Parties' and Case and Koslow's proposed redactions
Pl. MSJ Ex. 67	Wayfarer Parties	PII (phone number)	Seal pursuant to the Wayfarer Parties' proposed redactions
Pl. MSJ Ex. 81	Wayfarer Parties	Non-public financial information; film revenue receipts	Seal pursuant to the Wayfarer Parties' proposed redactions
Pl. MSJ Ex. 82	Wayfarer Parties	Non-public financial information; film revenue receipts	Seal pursuant to the Wayfarer Parties' proposed redactions
Pl. MSJ Ex. 83	Wayfarer Parties	Non-public financial information; film revenue receipts	Seal pursuant to the Wayfarer Parties' proposed redactions
Pl. MSJ Ex. 90	Wayfarer Parties	Non-public information about other Wayfarer projects	Seal pursuant to the Wayfarer Parties' proposed redactions
Pl. MSJ Ex. 188	Wayfarer Parties	Identification of (non-party) client of parties or services rendered thereto	Seal pursuant to the Wayfarer Parties' proposed redactions
Pl. MSJ Ex. 190	Wayfarer Parties	Identification of (non-party) client of parties or services rendered thereto	Seal pursuant to the Wayfarer Parties' proposed redactions
Pl. MSJ Ex. 191	Wayfarer Parties	Non-party information and allegations	Unseal

Exhibit Number	Sealing Proponent	Proposed Basis for Sealing	Court's Ruling
Pl. MSJ Ex. 208	Wayfarer Parties	Identification of (non-party) client of parties or services rendered thereto	Seal pursuant to Lively's proposed redactions
Pl. MSJ Ex. 209	Wayfarer Parties	Identification of (non-party) client of parties or services rendered thereto	Seal pursuant to Lively's proposed redactions
Pl. MSJ Ex. 212	Wayfarer Parties	Identification of (non-party) client of parties or services rendered thereto	Seal pursuant to the Wallace Non-Parties' proposed redactions
Pl. MSJ Ex. 215	Wayfarer Parties	Identification of (non-party) client of parties or services rendered thereto	Seal pursuant to the Wallace Non-Parties' proposed redactions except for the first message at 8:57 AM and the words "actually dropped" and "Page six" in the message at 9:41 AM
Pl. MSJ Ex. 216	Wayfarer Parties	Identification of (non-party) client of parties or services rendered thereto	Seal pursuant to proposed redactions provided by Lively
Pl. MSJ Ex. 217	Wayfarer Parties	Identification of (non-party) client of parties or services rendered thereto	Seal pursuant to proposed redactions provided by Lively
Pl. MSJ Ex. 221	Wayfarer Parties	Identification of (non-party) client of parties or services rendered thereto	Seal pursuant to the Wayfarer Parties' proposed redactions
Pl. MSJ Ex. 222	Wayfarer Parties	Identification of (non-party) client of parties or services rendered thereto	Seal pursuant to the Wayfarer Parties' proposed redactions

Exhibit Number	Sealing Proponent	Proposed Basis for Sealing	Court's Ruling
Pl. MSJ Ex. 223	Wayfarer Parties	Identification of (non-party) client of parties or services rendered thereto	Seal pursuant to the Wayfarer Parties' proposed redactions
Pl. MSJ Ex. 224	Wayfarer Parties	Identification of (non-party) client of parties or services rendered thereto	Seal pursuant to Case and Koslow's proposed redactions at Dkt. No. 1159-3
Pl. MSJ Ex. 246	Wayfarer Parties	Competitively sensitive retainer agreement	Seal only the PII on the first page, the dollar amounts of the fees in Section 5, the dollar amounts in Section 8, the bank information, and the percentage in Section 8
Pl. MSJ Ex. 247	Wayfarer Parties	Identification of (non-party) client of parties or services rendered thereto; non-public financial information	Unseal
Pl. MSJ Ex. 280	Wayfarer Parties	Non-public financial information	Seal pursuant to the Wayfarer Parties' proposed redactions
Pl. MSJ Ex. 292	Wayfarer Parties	Non-public financial information	Seal pursuant to the Wayfarer Parties' proposed redactions
Pl. MSJ Ex. 299	Wayfarer Parties	Identification of (non-party) client of parties or services rendered thereto	Seal pursuant to Lively's proposed redactions
Def. MSJ Ex. 167	Wayfarer Parties	Competitively sensitive, irrelevant agreement terms	Seal only Section 2

Exhibit Number	Sealing Proponent	Proposed Basis for Sealing	Court's Ruling
Def. MSJ Ex. 170	Wayfarer Parties	Identification of (non-party) client of parties or services rendered thereto	Seal pursuant to Case and Koslow's proposed redactions
Def. MSJ Ex. 188	Wayfarer Parties	Non-party contact information	Seal pursuant to the Wayfarer Parties' proposed redactions
Def. MSJ Ex. 213	Wayfarer Parties	Identification of (non-party) client of parties or services rendered thereto	Seal pursuant to the Wayfarer Parties' proposed redactions
Def. MSJ Ex. 226	Wayfarer Parties	Identification of (non-party) client of parties or services rendered thereto	Seal pursuant to the redactions provided by both the Wayfarer Parties and Case and Koslow
Def. MSJ Ex. 231	Wayfarer Parties	Identification of (non-party) client of parties or services rendered thereto; medical information	Seal pursuant to Case and Koslow's proposed redactions at Dkt. No. 1159-3
Def. MSJ Ex. 235	Wayfarer Parties	Identification of (non-party) client of parties or services rendered thereto	Seal only the proposed redactions on KCASE-000003358, KCASE-000003359, the first redaction on KCASE-000003360, the first redaction on KCASE-000003361, and the remaining redactions proposed by the Wayfarer Parties
Def. MSJ Ex. 259	Wayfarer Parties	Identification of (non-party) client of parties or services rendered thereto; irrelevant personal information	Seal pursuant to the proposed redactions provided by both the Wayfarer Parties' and Case and Koslow

Exhibit Number	Sealing Proponent	Proposed Basis for Sealing	Court's Ruling
WF Parties' Opp. to Lively Motion for Spoliation Sanctions Ex. 44	Wayfarer Parties	Irrelevant and sensitive information relating to relationship between attorneys and clients	Seal pursuant to the proposed redactions provided by the Wayfarer Parties
Hudson Decl. In Support of Lively's Reply to Opp. to Motion for Spoliation Sanctions, Ex. 67	Wayfarer Parties	Irrelevant and sensitive information relating to relationship between attorneys and clients	Seal only the PII on the first page, the dollar amounts of the fees in Section 5, the dollar amounts in Section 8, the bank information, and the percentage in Section 8
Hudson Decl. In Support of Lively's Reply to Opp. to Motion for Spoliation Sanctions, Ex. 68	Wayfarer Parties	Identification of (non-party) client of parties or services rendered thereto	Unseal

SO ORDERED.

Dated: January 16, 2026
New York, New York



LEWIS J. LIMAN
United States District Judge