## Exhibit A—Complaint of Beth Pyden to Plaintiff's Supervisor

Re: Face to face return. maybe you should read this.

Vince Smith <vsmith@harperwoods.net>

Mon 12/14/2020 9:00 AM

To: Elizabeth Pyden <elizabethpyden@sbcglobal.net>

Good morning Elizabeth,

I am in receipt of your email. I agree this is a hotly contested issue. We will look into this to determine if there are any department rule violations.

Thank you and stay safe and healthy.

VINCENT J. SMITH

Director

Harper Woods Department of Public Safety

19617 Harper Avenue

Harper Woods, MI 48225 Phone: 313-343-2530

Fax: 313-343-2514 Cell phone: 586-764-2162

vsmith@harperwoods.net

"We do the right thing not because it is expected of us, but rather because always doing the right thing is part of who we are." -Mark Esper, Secretary of Defense

The information contained in this transmission may contain privileged and confidential information, including protected information protected by federal and state privacy laws. It is intended only for the use of the person(s) named above. If you are not the intended recipient, or you believe you have received this message by error, you are hereby notified that any review, dissemination, distribution, or duplication of this communication is strictly prohibited. If you are not the intended recipient, please contact the sender immediately at (313) -343-2530 to inform them that you received this message in error, and permanently destroy all copies of the original message and any attachments.

From: Elizabeth Pyden <elizabethpyden@sbcglobal.net>

**Sent:** Friday, December 11, 2020 10:35 AM **To:** Vince Smith <vsmith@harperwoods.net>

Subject: Fwd: Face to face return. maybe you should read this.

Dear Chief Smith:

I am writing with a concern regarding how one of your officers conducts herself in her own community. As you know, return to school has been a hotly contested issue, however, we must do what is best for the community at large. I have noticed that in fact your city hall has closed indefinitely

Fw: Face to face return. maybe you should read this.

Vince Smith <vsmith@harperwoods.net>

Mon 12/14/2020 9:01 AM

To: Ted Stager <tstager@harperwoods.net>

Chief Stager,

Please review this message. Advise me if you determine there are any department rule violations.

From: Elizabeth Pyden <elizabethpyden@sbcglobal.net>

**Sent:** Friday, December 11, 2020 10:35 AM **To:** Vince Smith <vsmith@harperwoods.net>

Subject: Fwd: Face to face return. maybe you should read this.

Dear Chief Smith:

I am writing with a concern regarding how one of your officers conducts herself in her own community. As you know, return to school has been a hotly contested issue, however, we must do what is best for the community at large. I have noticed that in fact your city hall has closed indefinitely to assist in stopping the community spread. As an elected official, I do expect criticism. I also expect people to disagree with me. However, I do not expect the level of disrespect, even after being asked to stop, that has been shown by one of your public safety officers, Sandra Hernden. As a public servant, more is expected. I do not believe that you would like anyone expressing this level of anger, disrespect and veiled racism in your community. I have attached the exchange below. There have also been calls into our meeting, although I do believe there may have been some connection issues. I am disappointed that this type of behavior has been repeatedly rewarded with service awards. While I do not expect you to take any adverse action, I do believe that it is important for you to know how one of your officers is conducting herself within the community and perhaps offer some guidance.

Thank you for your attention to this matter. May you and your family have a blessed holiday season.

Elizabeth Pyden

Sent from my iPhone

Begin forwarded message:

**From:** "Pyden, Beth" <BPyden@cvs.k12.mi.us> **Date:** December 11, 2020 at 10:27:39 AM EST

To: elizabethpyden@sbcglobal.net

Subject: Fwd: Face to face return. maybe you should read this.

Sent from my iPhone

Begin forwarded message:

Fwd: Face to face return. maybe you should read this.

Elizabeth Pyden <elizabethpyden@sbcglobal.net>

Fri 12/11/2020 10:35 AM

To: Vince Smith <vsmith@harperwoods.net>

Dear Chief Smith:

I am writing with a concern regarding how one of your officers conducts herself in her own community. As you know, return to school has been a hotly contested issue, however, we must do what is best for the community at large. I have noticed that in fact your city hall has closed indefinitely to assist in stopping the community spread. As an elected official, I do expect criticism. I also expect people to disagree with me. However, I do not expect the level of disrespect, even after being asked to stop, that has been shown by one of your public safety officers, Sandra Hernden. As a public servant, more is expected. I do not believe that you would like anyone expressing this level of anger, disrespect and veiled racism in your community. I have attached the exchange below. There have also been calls into our meeting, although I do believe there may have been some connection issues. I am disappointed that this type of behavior has been repeatedly rewarded with service awards. While I do not expect you to take any adverse action, I do believe that it is important for you to know how one of your officers is conducting herself within the community and perhaps offer some guidance.

Thank you for your attention to this matter. May you and your family have a blessed holiday season.

Elizabeth Pyden

Sent from my iPhone

Begin forwarded message:

From: "Pyden, Beth" <BPyden@cvs.k12.mi.us> Date: December 11, 2020 at 10:27:39 AM EST

To: elizabethpyden@sbcglobal.net

Subject: Fwd: Face to face return. maybe you should read this.

Sent from my iPhone

Begin forwarded message:

From: sandra hernden <herndens883@yahoo.com>

**Date:** December 11, 2020 at 8:38:24 AM EST **To:** "Pyden, Beth" <BPyden@cvs.k12.mi.us>

Subject: Re: Face to face return. maybe you should read this.

Case 2:22-cv-12313-MAG-DRG ECF No. 1-2, PageID.18 Filed 09/29/22 Page 5 of 9 CAUTION: This email originated from outside your organization. Exercise caution when opening attachments or clicking links, especially from unknown senders.

Liz,

Your absolutely correct about respect. In stating so, this board has gained no respect from this community in which it serves by way of its actions.

There is no misinformation in your personal Facebook account, which I am willing to provide to this board should they choose to conduct an investigation. So I fail to see how using your spoken word is a personal attack, especially when it speaks to a matters of public opinion.

Additionally, Should you not receive any salary, you were elected to this board by the community. Thus, you still work for members of the community and you do in fact answer to all of us. Every board member does.

Enjoy this holiday season. Merry Christmas and God bless.

#sayhisname

Sent from my iPhone

On Dec 10, 2020, at 9:20 PM, Pyden, Beth <BPyden@cvs.k12.mi.us> wrote:

First, respect is earned not merely given. When you chosen to address me by the wrong name, that is incredibly disrespectful. It is also incredibly disrespectful to make personal attacks. Additionally, you do not pay my salary as we do not receive a salary for being on the school board. Even if we did receive a salary, it does not give you license to address anyone in such a hostile manner. Clearly, you are upset and I can appreciate that. However, I am choosing to not further engage until you are able to discuss this situation without personal attacks and misinformation.

Again, I hope you and your family have a blessed holiday season.

Beth

Sent from my iPhone

On Dec 10, 2020, at 8:48 PM, sandra hernden <a href="herndens883@yahoo.com">herndens883@yahoo.com</a> wrote:

CAUTION: This email originated from outside your organization. Exercise caution when opening attachments or clicking links, especially from unknown senders.

Liz,

Case 2:22-cv-12313-MAG-DRG ECF No. 1-2, PageID.19 Filed 09/29/22 Page 6 of 9 First, please address me as Mrs. Hernden. I do pay your salary by way of tax dollars and several passed school mileages. Being respectful should be paramount when addressing people you respond to.

Liz, you have a law degree. No one in your degree is it certified as a medical degree and from what I remember from your bio, a civil attorney. So I hardly see how you are qualified to make any rational medical decision. However I'm sure you are versed in the Constitution, civil rights, bill of rights. I willing to bet Justice Gisenburg was a women you idolized for her stance on "my body, my choice."

That being said, not one member of this school board has any right to decide the fate of my child, or any child for that matter that attends this district. Again this is about choice! Not your political agenda. My children and every child/parent should have a right to choose. A right this district, this board, and you, fail to afford that opportunity. Every single one of you refuse to listen to medical doctors, including the leading infectious disease doctor, Fauci. If you were truly looking at facts, you would see that Covid 19 has over a 98.999% survival rate. So explain again how deadly this disease is again. And yes, I have lost family, friends, and mentors to this disease, mainly because our governor Gretchen Whitmer, signed their death warrants placing Covid patients in there nursing and rehab facilities.

Additionally, you have no children to speak of, at least based on your Facebook profile, and only a poodle. You have allowed your political views-"unworkable" online schooling program, blaming President Trump and your "white privilege" statements, affect your judgement and allowed it to make your irrational decisions. Surely had I made statements such at these, I would be fired from my job, especially as you are public servant. Once you allow your political beliefs to interfere with your profession as a school administrator, you have failed every single child in which you claim you are acting in the best interest of.

Now I know this board, by way of its actions, have shown absolutely no interest in what parents have said, requesting a choice for how their child learns. To be quite honest, I see everyone of you sit with a smug look on your face acting as if you are royalty addressing the "pheasants," only allowing a select few make a comment that is pre-screened, like having the questions before a test. Must be good to be the queen.

However, if this school board truly cared about every aspect of you children's education, mental, and psychological well-being, you would allow every parent to speak. So what if the meeting takes longer. It's what you're paid to do.

Why don't you take note of how L'anse Creuse is making it work. I'm sure if you asked for their model, they would gladly show you the way. Or are all of you to proud to do that?

In closing, how many more children will have to commit suicide before this school board will wake up? Do you even know his name? Don't worry, I'll wait. #sayhisname

Sent from my iPhone

Case 2:22-cv-12313-MAG-DRG ECF No. 1-2, PageID.20 Filed 09/29/22 Page 7 of 9 Thank you for forwarding us an editorial. I appreciate this man's opinion, just

as I have appreciated the opinions on both sides of this issue. One thing we can all agree on is that we want our kids back in school because there is no replacement for face to face to instruction. However, we can only do this when we can guarantee that doing so can be done safely. This is difficult when we are making decisions 15,000+ students and 2000+ employees, each with their own stories, struggles and frustrations. I empathize with how this has touched families and upended lives- both for those who expect face to face and those who expect remote.

Thank you for your involvement and attention. It is always appreciated. I wish you and your family a safe and blessed holiday season.

Beth

Sent from my iPhone

On Dec 10, 2020, at 12:42 PM, sandra hernden <herndens883@yahoo.com> wrote:

CAUTION: This email originated from outside your organization. Exercise caution when opening attachments or clicking links, especially from unknown senders.

https://www.chicagotribune.com/columns/john-kass/ct-coronavirus-schools-kass-20201210-kityu45m2jfh5hyd6vcfreizeu-story.html? fbclid=lwAR0O0RdBXx467U039UVh9jUiD7z6-tpa57QaBpFl9iD9ircM3VT69z\_UP7A

Sent from my iPhone

On Nov 3, 2020, at 7:24 AM, sandra hernden <a href="herndens883@yahoo.com">herndens883@yahoo.com</a> wrote:

Member of the CVS school board,

Let me start by expressing my sheer and utter disgust with all of you regarding your vote last night about face to face hybrid learning. You have failed every single child in this school district. You have failed because each and every one of you has allowed your political beliefs to interfere with making a decisions that are right for our children as Ms. Pyden so eloquently displayed in her Facebook post attached below.

My children are failing their classes because of the "unworkable."

IEP. Once 3.5 GPA students now at a 1.5 GPA. My children's mental health has suffered greatly because of your "Gestapo" tactics. You have taken our choice away! You have turned this school board into a Dictatorship. You have taken away the right to choose how to learn of every parent and child within this district. This is a democracy, although as educators you have forgotten that. Yes. You have failed all the children in this district. I can no longer afford tutors for my children because now I have to pay for visits for their mental well being. Which of you can I submit these bills to to be paid? Why? Because you have failed

my children miserably.

You say Mr. Roberts that you are "guided by numbers." Have you actually researched the impact of other diseases like Tuberculosis and its death rate last year? Tuberculosis killed more people than Covid 19, without respiratory precautions. Mr. Roberts, and members of this board, have you looked at the survival rate of this disease? Over 98% survival rate. No matter what we do, this disease isn't going anywhere. So we are going to hide? Or are we going to adapt and know it's there and live accordingly? As educators, one would think that all of you would look at the entire picture. Obviously not here. You're all guided by your own political beliefs and have tunnel vision because of your political beliefs. Yes. You have failed our children.

I know, I know. We put a "hybrid model in place." This was nothing more than smoke and mirrors to keep parents at bay while in the background, every single one of you knew you this wouldn't happen. You had your own political agenda. Not one of you legitimately cares about our children.

Not a single one of you have had your lives turned upside down because of your "unworkable" plan. Not one of you have had to deal with the melt downs because assignments have been completed several times just to have to do it all over again because of your "unworkable" plan. None of you have had to give up working, your livelihood, seen your child's mental stability decline, or the peace and harmony in your home decline. Not a single one of you! Why? Because you don't have children subjected to your "unworkable" plan.

I find it amazing that the Lanse Cruese School District has been operating on a hybrid face to face model, and is doing quite well. Yet the 2nd largest school district in the country can't get it together to do the same. Absolutely shameful. Why you may ask, because the CVS school board has put their political beliefs and agendas ahead of any child's education and mental well being. Yes, all of you have failed our children.

All of you need to put your political beliefs aside and do what is best not only for the sake of the education of our children but their mental well being. Revisiting the "Face to face" learning and returning to school in January is absolutely not acceptable, nor

Case 2:22-cv-12313-MAG-DRG ECF No. 1-2, PageID.22 Filed 09/29/22 Page 9 of 9 should it be an option. Our children need to be back in the classrooms before then. Put your politics aside! You're undoubtedly hurting my children. All children.

As a taxpayer, I pay your salaries. You work for us. We demand that "Face to face" instruction happen without delay! Without your sidebar politics. Your "unworkable" plan has proven it's not working!

Sandra Hernden

<IMG\_2449.JPG>

Sent from my iPhone