

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE DISTRICT OF MASSACHUSETTS**

ALEXANDER KESTENBAUM and
STUDENTS AGAINST ANTISEMITISM,
INC.,

Plaintiffs,

v.

PRESIDENT AND FELLOWS OF
HARVARD COLLEGE,

Defendant.

Case No. 1:24-cv-10092-RGS

Oral Argument Requested

**DEFENDANT’S MOTION TO DISMISS AND
MOTION TO STRIKE PLAINTIFFS’ COMPLAINT**

Defendant President and Fellows of Harvard College (“Harvard”) hereby moves to dismiss this action in its entirety pursuant to Federal Rules of Civil Procedure 12(b)(1) and 12(b)(6) and, in the alternative, moves to strike Plaintiffs’ demands for injunctive relief and punitive damages under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 12(f). The grounds for this motion, which are explained in detail in the accompanying Memorandum of Law, include the following:

1. The Court should dismiss Plaintiffs’ challenge to Harvard’s ongoing response to antisemitism under Rule 12(b)(1) because it is premature.
2. The Court should dismiss Alexander Kestenbaum’s claims for injunctive relief, and all of Students Against Antisemitism’s claims, under Rule 12(b)(1) for lack of standing.
3. The Court should dismiss Plaintiffs’ Title VI claim under Rule 12(b)(6) because Plaintiffs do not plausibly allege Harvard demonstrated discriminatory animus nor do they plausibly allege that Harvard acted with deliberate indifference.

4. The Court should dismiss Plaintiffs' breach of contract and implied covenant claims under Rule 12(b)(6) because they fail to plead a breach of contract and because their implied covenant claim is duplicative of their insufficient Title VI and contract claims.

5. The Court should strike Plaintiffs' demands for injunctive relief because Plaintiffs seek an impermissibly broad injunction and demand particular disciplinary measures, a form of relief not available under Title VI. The Court should also strike Plaintiffs' demands for punitive damages, which are not available under Title VI or Massachusetts contract law.

6. In support of this Motion, Harvard submits the accompanying Memorandum of Law and the Declarations of Meredith Weenick, Timothy Whelsky, and Felicia Ellsworth.

WHEREFORE, Harvard respectfully requests that the Court dismiss this action in its entirety and strike Plaintiffs' demands for injunctive relief and punitive damages.

REQUEST FOR ORAL ARGUMENT

Pursuant to Local Rule 7.1(d), Defendant respectfully requests oral argument of this Motion.

DATED: April 12, 2024

Respectfully Submitted,

PRESIDENT AND FELLOWS OF HARVARD
COLLEGE

By its attorneys,

/s/ Felicia H. Ellsworth

Mark A. Kirsch (*pro hac vice*)
Gina Merrill (*pro hac vice*)
KING & SPALDING LLP
1185 Avenue of the Americas
34th Floor
New York, NY 10036
mkirsch@kslaw.com
gmerrill@kslaw.com
Tel: (212) 790-5329
Fax: (212) 556-2222

Felicia H. Ellsworth, BBO #665232
WILMER CUTLER PICKERING
HALE AND DORR LLP
60 State Street
Boston, MA 02109
Tel: (617) 526-6000
Fax: (617) 526-5000
felicia.ellsworth@wilmerhale.com

Zachary Fardon (*pro hac vice*)
KING & SPALDING LLP
110 N. Wacker Drive
Suite 3800
Chicago, IL 60606
zfordon@kslaw.com
Tel: (312) 764-6960
Fax: (312) 995-6330

Seth P. Waxman (*pro hac vice*)
Bruce M. Berman (*pro hac vice*)
Jeremy W. Brinster (*pro hac vice*)
WILMER CUTLER PICKERING
HALE AND DORR LLP
2100 Pennsylvania Avenue NW
Washington, DC 20037
Tel: (202) 663-6000
Fax: (202) 663-6363
seth.waxman@wilmerhale.com
bruce.berman@wilmerhale.com
jeremy.brinster@wilmerhale.com

Zoe M. Beiner (*pro hac vice*)
KING & SPALDING LLP
1700 Pennsylvania Avenue NW
Suite 900
Washington, DC 20006
zbeiner@kslaw.com
Tel: (202) 626-5575
Fax: (202) 626-3737

LOCAL RULE 7.1 CERTIFICATION

The undersigned hereby certifies that on April 11, 2024, counsel for Harvard conferred with Plaintiffs' counsel in a good faith attempt to resolve or narrow the issues involved in this motion, and that the parties did not reach an agreement.

/s/ Felicia H. Ellsworth _____

Felicia H. Ellsworth

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on April 12, 2024, I caused this document to be filed through the CM/ECF system, where it will be sent electronically to the registered participants as identified on the Notice of Electronic Filing.

/s/ Felicia H. Ellsworth _____

Felicia H. Ellsworth