Case 3:18-cv-00428-DMS-MDD Document 592 Filed 05/19/21 PageID.9875 Page 1 of 11

1 **BRIAN BOYNTON** Acting Assistant Attorney General 2 WILLIAM C. PEACHEY 3 Director 4 Office of Immigration Litigation WILLIAM C. SILVIS 5 Assistant Director Office of Immigration Litigation 6 SARAH B. FABIAN 7 Senior Litigation Counsel 8 NICOLE N. MURLEY Senior Litigation Counsel 9 Office of Immigration Litigation 10 U.S. Department of Justice Box 868, Ben Franklin Station 11 Washington, D.C. 20044 12 Telephone: (202) 532-4824 Fax: (202) 616-8962 13 14 ADAM L. BRAVERMAN United States Attorney 15 SAMUEL W. BETTWY 16 Assistant U.S. Attorney California Bar No. 94918 17 Office of the U.S. Attorney 18 880 Front Street, Room 6293 San Diego, CA 92101-8893 19 619-546-7125 20 619-546-7751 (fax) 21 Attorneys for Federal Respondents-22 Defendants 23 24 25 26 27 28

Lee Gelernt* Judy Rabinovitz* Anand Balakrishnan* Daniel A. Galindo (SBN 292854) AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION FOUNDATION 125 Broad St., 18th Floor New York, NY 10004 T: (212) 549-2660 F: (212) 549-2654 lgelernt@aclu.org *jrabinovitz@aclu.org* abalakrishnan@aclu.org dgalindo@aclu.org Bardis Vakili (SBN 247783) ACLU FOUNDATION OF SAN DIEGO & IMPERIAL **COUNTIES** P.O. Box 87131 San Diego, CA 92138-7131 T: (619) 398-4485 F: (619) 232-0036 *bvakili*@*aclusandiego.org* Stephen B. Kang (SBN 292280) Spencer E. Amdur (SBN 320069) AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION FOUNDATION 39 Drumm Street San Francisco, CA 94111 T: (415) 343-1198 F: (415) 395-0950 skang@aclu.org

Attorneys for Petitioners-Plaintiffs *Admitted Pro Hac Vice

samdur@aclu.org

С	Case 3:18-cv-00428-DMS-MDD Document 592 File	ed 05/19/21	PageID.9876	Page 2 of 11	
1	LINITED STATES D		OUDT		
2		UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA			
3	MS. L, et al.,	Case No	. 18cv428 DM	S MDD	
4 5	Petitioners Plaintiffs	utiffs, JOINT STATUS REPORT			
6				PORT	
7	U.S. IMMIGRATION AND CUSTOMS				
8	ENFORCEMENT, et al.,				
9 10	Respondents-Defendants.				
11	l				
12	On April 9, 2021, the Court ordered the parties to file a joint status report (JSR)				
13	by 3:00 pm on May 19, 2021, in anticipation of the status conference scheduled at			neduled at	
14 15	1:30 pm on May 21, 2021. ECF No. 587. In accordance with this order of the Court,			the Court,	
16	the parties provide the below Joint Status Report.				
17					
18 19					
19 20					
21	///				
22					
23 24					
25					
26					
27					
28					

I. DEFENDANTS' POSITIONS

1

2

3

A. Update Regarding Government's Implementation of Settlement Agreement

4	SETTLEMENT PROCESS	DESCRIPTION	NUMBER
5 6	Election Forms ¹	Total number of executed election forms received by the Government	452 (264 Parents/188 Children) ²
7 8		• Number who elect to receive settlement procedures	292 (161 Parents/131 Children)
9		• Number who waive settlement procedures	160 (103 Parents/57 Children) ³
10 11	Interviews	Total number of class members who received interviews	180 ⁴
12 13		Parents who received interviews	94
13		• Children who received interviews	86
15 16			
17			
18 10			
19 20			
21	¹ The number of election forms r 2021 .	eported here is the number received l	by the Government as of April 22,
22 23	² The number of children's election forms is lower than the number of parent election forms because in many instances a parent electing settlement procedures submitted an election form on his or her own behalf or opposing counsel e-mailed requesting settlement implementation for the entire family, but no separate form was submitted on behalf of the child.		
23 24			
25	³ The number of children's waivers is lower because some parents have submitted waivers only for themselves and some parents who have waived reunification also waived settlement procedures and have therefore not provided a form for the child.		
26		interviewed because of rare languages	· ·

⁴ Some individuals could not be interviewed because of rare languages; these individuals were placed in Section 240 proceedings. This number includes credible fear and reasonable fear interviews, as well as affirmative asylum interviews.

28

1	Decisions	Total number of CFI/RFI	73°
I		decisions issued for	
2		parents by USCIS	710
		Number of parents determined to	71°
3		establish CF or RF	
4		upon review by USCIS	
		USCIS	
5		• Number of parents whose CF or RF	2
6		finding remains	
		negative upon review by USCIS	
7		Total number of CFI	737
8		decisions issued for	15
0		children by USCIS	
9		Number of children	73 ⁸
10		determined to	
10		establish CF by	
11		USCIS	A
12		Number of children	0
14		determined not to	
13		establish CF by USCIS	
1.4		Total number of	25
			43
14		affirmative asylum	
14 15		affirmative asylum decisions by USCIS	
15		affirmative asylum decisions by USCIS • Number of parents	3
		affirmative asylum decisions by USCIS • Number of parents	3
15		affirmative asylum decisions by USCIS	3
15 16 17		affirmative asylum decisions by USCIS • Number of parents	3
15 16 17 18		affirmative asylum decisions by USCIS • Number of parents	3
15 16 17	⁵ This number is the aggregate of	affirmative asylum decisions by USCIS • Number of parents granted asylum by USCIS • the number of parents whose negative	ative CFI/RFI determinations were
15 16 17 18 19	reconsidered, number of parents w	affirmative asylum decisions by USCIS • Number of parents granted asylum by USCIS f the number of parents whose negative CFI/RFI determination	ative CFI/RFI determinations were on was unchanged, and individuals
15 16 17 18 19 20	reconsidered, number of parents w who were referred to 240 proceeding	affirmative asylum decisions by USCIS • Number of parents granted asylum by USCIS f the number of parents whose negative cFI/RFI determination ngs without interview because of a ratio	ative CFI/RFI determinations were on was unchanged, and individuals are language. This number excludes
15 16 17 18 19	reconsidered, number of parents w who were referred to 240 proceeding	affirmative asylum decisions by USCIS • Number of parents granted asylum by USCIS f the number of parents whose negative CFI/RFI determination	ative CFI/RFI determinations were on was unchanged, and individuals are language. This number excludes
15 16 17 18 19 20 21	reconsidered, number of parents w who were referred to 240 proceedin 12 cases where a parent already had included in the interview totals). ⁶ This number includes parents who	affirmative asylum decisions by USCIS • Number of parents granted asylum by USCIS f the number of parents whose negative CFI/RFI determination negative CFI/RFI determination negative data not the interview because of a radius of an NTA from ICE or was already of the original positive CF/RF determination of the received positive cf po	ative CFI/RFI determinations were on was unchanged, and individuals are language. This number excludes rdered removed by an IJ (which are tions upon reconsideration, parents
 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 	reconsidered, number of parents w who were referred to 240 proceedin 12 cases where a parent already had included in the interview totals). ⁶ This number includes parents why who received a Notice to Appear b	affirmative asylum decisions by USCIS • Number of parents granted asylum by USCIS f the number of parents whose negative CFI/RFI determination and an NTA from ICE or was already or oreceived positive CF/RF determination ased on their child's positive CF determination and the child's positive child'	ative CFI/RFI determinations were on was unchanged, and individuals are language. This number excludes rdered removed by an IJ (which are tions upon reconsideration, parents
15 16 17 18 19 20 21	reconsidered, number of parents w who were referred to 240 proceedin 12 cases where a parent already had included in the interview totals). ⁶ This number includes parents wh who received a Notice to Appear b placed in Section 240 proceedings	affirmative asylum decisions by USCIS • Number of parents granted asylum by USCIS f the number of parents whose negative vhose negative CFI/RFI determination ngs without interview because of a radian NTA from ICE or was already or o received positive CF/RF determination pased on their child's positive CF determination pased on their child's positive pased on their child's positive pased on their child's pased on their child's pased on their child's pased on their child's pased on	ative CFI/RFI determinations were on was unchanged, and individuals are language. This number excludes rdered removed by an IJ (which are ations upon reconsideration, parents termination, and parents who were
 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 	reconsidered, number of parents w who were referred to 240 proceedin 12 cases where a parent already had included in the interview totals). ⁶ This number includes parents wh who received a Notice to Appear b placed in Section 240 proceedings ⁷ This number is the aggregate of	affirmative asylum decisions by USCIS • Number of parents granted asylum by USCIS f the number of parents whose negative CFI/RFI determination of the second	ative CFI/RFI determinations were on was unchanged, and individuals are language. This number excludes rdered removed by an IJ (which are ations upon reconsideration, parents etermination, and parents who were et a positive CF determination, the
 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 	reconsidered, number of parents w who were referred to 240 proceedin 12 cases where a parent already had included in the interview totals). ⁶ This number includes parents wh who received a Notice to Appear b placed in Section 240 proceedings ⁷ This number is the aggregate of	affirmative asylum decisions by USCIS • Number of parents granted asylum by USCIS f the number of parents whose negative CFI/RFI determination and whose negative CFI/RFI determination and without interview because of a rad an NTA from ICE or was already or oreceived positive CF/RF determination based on their child's positive CF determination and the number of children who received a negative CF determination, and or oreceived positive CF determination.	ative CFI/RFI determinations were on was unchanged, and individuals are language. This number excludes rdered removed by an IJ (which are ations upon reconsideration, parents etermination, and parents who were et a positive CF determination, the
 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 	reconsidered, number of parents w who were referred to 240 proceedin 12 cases where a parent already had included in the interview totals). ⁶ This number includes parents wh who received a Notice to Appear b placed in Section 240 proceedings ⁷ This number is the aggregate of number of children who received proceedings without interview beck	affirmative asylum decisions by USCIS • Number of parents granted asylum by USCIS • It is the number of parents whose negative CFI/RFI determination is without interview because of a rad an NTA from ICE or was already or or received positive CF/RF determination based on their child's positive CF determination and the number of children who receives a negative CF determination, and on ause of a rare language.	ative CFI/RFI determinations were on was unchanged, and individuals are language. This number excludes rdered removed by an IJ (which are ations upon reconsideration, parents etermination, and parents who were ed a positive CF determination, the children who were referred to 240
 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 	reconsidered, number of parents w who were referred to 240 proceedin 12 cases where a parent already had included in the interview totals). ⁶ This number includes parents wh who received a Notice to Appear b placed in Section 240 proceedings ⁷ This number is the aggregate of number of children who received proceedings without interview beck ⁸ This number includes children wh to Appear as a dependent on their	affirmative asylum decisions by USCIS • Number of parents granted asylum by USCIS f the number of parents whose negative CFI/RFI determination in the second of the	ative CFI/RFI determinations were on was unchanged, and individuals are language. This number excludes rdered removed by an IJ (which are ations upon reconsideration, parents etermination, and parents who were ed a positive CF determination, the children who were referred to 240 ion, children who received a Notice
 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 	 reconsidered, number of parents w who were referred to 240 proceedin 12 cases where a parent already had included in the interview totals). ⁶ This number includes parents why who received a Notice to Appear b placed in Section 240 proceedings ⁷ This number is the aggregate of number of children who received proceedings without interview beck ⁸ This number includes children who 	affirmative asylum decisions by USCIS • Number of parents granted asylum by USCIS f the number of parents whose negative CFI/RFI determination in the second of the	ative CFI/RFI determinations were on was unchanged, and individuals are language. This number excludes rdered removed by an IJ (which are ations upon reconsideration, parents etermination, and parents who were ed a positive CF determination, the children who were referred to 240 ion, children who received a Notice

Removals	Number of class members who have been returned to their country of origin as a result of waiving the settlement procedures	103 Parents ¹⁰
	• Number of children referred/returned to immigration court	12
	Number of children granted asylum by USCIS	59
	Number of parents referred to immigration court	5

B. The President's February 2, 2021 "Executive Order on the Establishment of Interagency Task Force on the Reunification of Families"

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

 $\mathbf{20}$

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

As noted in the parties' March 10 filing, the parties have entered into settlement negotiations which remain ongoing, and the Task Force is continuing its work both in parallel and in conjunction with these settlement discussions. ECF No. 578. The parties are discussing settlement issues among themselves on a regular basis, and the next formal Settlement Conference with Judge Dembin is scheduled on June 17, 2021. Issues previously reported on by Defendants in joint status reports are now being addressed by the parties as part of the ongoing settlement negotiations.

 ⁹ This number includes children granted asylum as a dependent on their parent's asylum application.
 ¹⁰ This number is as of May 17, 2021.

II. <u>MS. L. PLAINTIFFS' POSITIONS</u>

A. <u>Steering Committee Outreach to Sponsors and Parents of Children of</u> <u>Expanded Class Members</u>

The government has provided eleven lists identifying 1,134 children of expanded class members. The government has also identified 64 "recategorized" deported parents from the original class, who the Steering Committee has sought to contact as part of its efforts to reach members of the expanded class.¹¹ The Steering Committee's recent efforts have been targeted at locating the parents of this group of 1,198 (1,134 plus 64) children.¹²

Of these 1,198 children, for 807 the Steering Committee has reached the parents (or their attorneys), or otherwise resolved the cases. This represents an increase of 54 children's parents since our last status report. We describe below the status of our continuing efforts to reach the parents of the remaining 391 children, down from 445 in the last status report.

The parents of 391 children fall into three groups. First, there are approximately 277 children whose parents are believed to have been removed from the United States following separation from their children, and our efforts to locate them in their country of origin are ongoing. Second, there is a group of approximately 100 children whose parents are believed to be in the United States, and efforts to locate them in the United States are also ongoing. Third, there is a group of 14 children for whom the government has not provided a phone number for

¹¹ In its portion of the December 12, 2018 Joint Status Report, the government disclosed the existence of what we call the "Recategorized Original Class", *i.e.*, members of the original class who were not identified as part of the government's initial disclosures in the summer of 2018. The government only provided contact information for this group in February 2019, after the Steering Committee's efforts to contact original class members had concluded – and so, as a logistical matter, the Steering Committee has conducted outreach to the 64 parents in this group who were deported following separation from their children, as part of the Steering Committee's efforts to contact *expanded* class members.

¹² Because some of the parents of these children entered with more than one child, there are 1,082 parents in this combined group.

the parent, child, sponsor or attorney. This group has not changed since our last 1 2 status report.

3 4 5

Steering Committee Efforts to Locate Parents

First, as previously reported, the Steering Committee attempts to reach all parents, sponsors and attorneys by telephone. The Steering Committee has renewed these efforts and had been engaged in an effort to reach parents, where possible, by 6 using the additional contact information provided by the government in late 2020 7 from databases of the Executive Office for Immigration Review and U.S. Customs 8 and Immigration Enforcement. This information includes phone numbers that had 9 not previously been disclosed for children and parents, as well as contact information 10 for a number of attorneys. 11

Where those efforts are not successful, the Steering Committee has engaged 12 in time-consuming and arduous on-the-ground searches for parents. These on-the-13 ground searches have been focused abroad in the countries of origin of parents who 14 were removed from the United States following separation from their children. 15 These searches are ongoing by members of the Steering Committee, and we have 16 recently devoted additional resources to these efforts. As previously reported, on-17 the-ground searches for separated parents are ongoing when it is safe to do so, but 18 are limited and in some cases cannot take place due to risks associated with the 19 COVID-19 pandemic. $\mathbf{20}$

Also, as previously reported, the Steering Committee has established toll-free 21 telephone numbers in the United States, Guatemala, Honduras, Mexico and El 22 Salvador to receive inbound phone calls from potential members of the expanded 23 class. The Steering Committee has distributed this number both by email and U.S. 24 Mail to a number of non-governmental organizations and other community 25 organizations in the United States, who may be able to help us locate parents because 26 they work in the communities these parents are likely to have contact with. In

addition, the Steering Committee sent letters in Spanish and English to 1 approximately 1,600 addresses provided by the government for the potential class 2 members that the Steering Committee has not yet reached. These letters explain our 3 role in this action and invite parents to contact the Steering Committee to call these 4 toll-free numbers. The Steering Committee continues to monitor voicemail boxes 5 reachable via these toll-free numbers, and plans to renew its mailing effort with the 6 new address information received for children and their attorneys from the 7 government. 8

Additionally, as previously reported, the Steering Committee has undertaken 9 broad-based media outreach efforts to publicize the toll-free phone numbers created 10 by the Steering Committee in Spanish language media. The Steering Committee has 11 also arranged for advertisements on Spanish language radio in Central America. 12 Those advertisements have begun airing. The Steering Committee continues to work 13 to identify opportunities to broadly disseminate the toll-free numbers through 14 various media to maximize visibility to potential Ms. L. class members, including 15 seeking to collaborate on such media outreach initiatives with other non-profit 16 organizations.

The Steering Committee also receives additional contact information for a limited number of families from third parties, including a number of nongovernmental organizations. The Steering Committee uses that information to reattempt telephonic communication with all families for whom new contact information has become available, in addition to the efforts underway using new information provided by the government as described above.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

III. <u>MMM-Dora Plaintiffs' Report Regarding Settlement Implementation</u>

The parties continue to work together to implement the Settlement Agreement approved on November 15, 2018. Class counsel are providing the Government with signed waiver forms as they are received from class members, and class counsel are continuing to work on outreach efforts to class members who may qualify for relief under the settlement. The parties continue to meet and confer on issues related to settlement implementation as they arise.

1	DATED: May 19, 2021	Respectfully submitt	ed,	
2				
	/s/ Lee Gelernt			
3		Lee Gelernt*		
4		Judy Rabinovitz*		
5		Anand Balakrishnan*		
3		Daniel A. Galindo (S	<i>,</i>	
6			LIBERTIES UNION	
7		FOUNDATION	71	
		125 Broad St., 18th F New York, NY 1000		
8		New York, NY 1000 T: (212) 549-2660	4	
9		F: (212) 549-2654		
10		lgelernt@aclu.org		
		jrabinovitz@aclu.org		
11		abalakrishnan@aclu.org		
12		dgalindo@aclu.org		
13	Bardis Vakili (SBN 247783)		247783)	
14		ACLU FOUNDATION OF SAN DIEGO		
15		& IMPERIAL COUNTIES		
15		P.O. Box 87131		
16		San Diego, CA 92138-7131		
17		T: (619) 398-4485		
		F: (619) 232-0036		
18		bvakili@aclusandieg	0.0rg	
19		Stephen B. Kang (SE	3N 292280)	
20		Spencer E. Amdur (SBN 320069)		
21		AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION		
21		FOUNDATION		
22		39 Drumm Street		
23		San Francisco, CA 94111		
		T: (415) 343-1198		
24		F: (415) 395-0950		
25		skang@aclu.org		
26		samdur@aclu.org		
27		Attorneys for Petitioners-Plaintiffs *Admitted Pro Hac Vice		
28		*Admitted Pro	Ηας νιςε	
-0		8		
		0	18cv428 DM	

1	BRIAN BOYNTON
2	Acting Assistant Attorney General
3	WILLIAM C. PEACHEY Director
	WILLIAM C. SILVIS
4	Assistant Director
5	/s/ Sarah B. Fabian
6	SARAH B. FABIAN
7	Senior Litigation Counsel
8	NICOLE N. MURLEY
9	Senior Litigation Counsel Office of Immigration Litigation
10	Civil Division
11	U.S. Department of Justice
	P.O. Box 868, Ben Franklin Station Washington, DC 20044
12	(202) 532-4824
13	(202) 616-8962 (facsimile)
14	Sarah.B.Fabian@usdoj.gov
15	Attorneys for Respondents-Defendants
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
27	
20	
	9 18cv428 DM