

Exhibit F

11/20/2024

Richard Kadrey, et al. v. Meta Platforms, Inc. Michael Clark 30(b)(6), Vol III
Highly Confidential - Attorneys' Eyes Only

Page 204

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION

RICHARD KADREY, ET AL.,)
INDIVIDUAL AND REPRESENTATIVE)
PLAINTIFFS,) LEAD CASE NO.
v.) 3:23-cv-03417-VC
META PLATFORMS, INC.,)
DEFENDANT.)
)

* * * H I G H L Y C O N F I D E N T I A L * * *
* * * A T T O R N E Y S ' E Y E S O N L Y * * *

VIDEO-RECORDED 30(B)(6) DEPOSITION OF
MICHAEL CLARK
VOLUME III
WEDNESDAY, NOVEMBER 20, 2024
SAN FRANCISCO, CALIFORNIA
9:38 A.M. PST

REPORTED BY AUDRA E. CRAMER, CSR NO. 9901

DIGITAL EVIDENCE GROUP
1730 M Street, NW, Suite 812
Washington, D.C. 20036
(202) 232-0646

11/20/2024

Richard Kadrey, et al. v. Meta Platforms, Inc. Michael Clark 30(b)(6), Vol III
Highly Confidential - Attorneys' Eyes Only

Page 211

1 A. Good morning.

2 Q. We meet again.

3 On this third day of 30(b)(6)

4 testimony, your counsel gave me this binder.

5 I'd like to enter this binder in as an exhibit.

6 (Whereupon, Exhibit 619 was

7 marked for identification.)

8 BY MS. POUEYMIROU:

9 Q. And what is this binder, Mr. Clark?

10 A. This binder is some of the information

11 that I had used in preparation; a list of

12 additional folks that I had spoken with, the

13 same list with people added; a few of the

14 Lamas -- so L-a-m-a -- that we had discussed;

15 and some of the other additional information

16 that we said we would follow up with today.

17 Q. Great.

18 And who are the new people that you

19 spoke with at Meta to prepare for today?

20 A. Let me see if the other list is here so

21 I can give you the difference.

22 Ahmad Al-Dahle, A-h-m-a-d,

11/20/2024

Richard Kadrey, et al. v. Meta Platforms, Inc. Michael Clark 30(b)(6), Vol III
Highly Confidential - Attorneys' Eyes Only

Page 212

1 A-l-dash-D-a-h-l-e.

2 Sean -- oh, sorry. Dustin Holland,

3 D-u-s-t-i-n, H-o-l-l-a-n-d.

4 Melanie Kambadur, M-e-l-a-n-i-e,

5 K-a-m-b-a-d-u-r.

6 Joelle Pineau, J-o-e-l-l-e,

7 P-i-n-e-a-u.

8 Hugo Tuvron, H-u-g-o, T-o-u-v-r-o-n.

9 And then I had also spoken to Sean

10 Bell, S-e-a-n, B-e-l-l.

11 And then Kenneth, who -- these are not
12 on the list, but Kenneth's last name I always
13 forget.

14 MS. HARTNETT: Heafield.

15 THE WITNESS: H-e-a-f-f-i-e-l-d [sic].

16 MS. HARTNETT: And Shiyang.

17 THE WITNESS: And Shiyang,

18 S-h-i-y-a-n-g.

19 Shiyang's last name is Chen; right?

20 MS. HARTNETT: Correct.

21 THE WITNESS: C-h-e-n.

22

11/20/2024

Richard Kadrey, et al. v. Meta Platforms, Inc. Michael Clark 30(b)(6), Vol III
Highly Confidential - Attorneys' Eyes Only

Page 213

1 BY MS. POUEYMIROU:

2 Q. I'm sorry. The last person you said
3 was S-h-i- --

4 A. -- y-a-n-g.

5 Q. Okay.

6 A. And Chen, C-h-e-n.

7 Q. Okay. And why did you speak with
8 Mr. Al-Dahle.

9 A. I spoke with him to see if there were
10 any additional conversations that had happened
11 around the use of copyrighted material that were
12 outside the presence of counsel.

13 Q. And what did he say?

14 A. He said that there were not.

15 Q. So to clarify, you're saying that he
16 said there were no additional conversations that
17 happened around the use of copyrighted material
18 outside the presence of counsel?

19 A. That is correct.

20 Q. And by "additional conversations," what
21 are you referring to?

22 A. By "additional conversations," on the

11/20/2024

Richard Kadrey, et al. v. Meta Platforms, Inc. Michael Clark 30(b)(6), Vol III
Highly Confidential - Attorneys' Eyes Only

Page 349

1 Q. This says, "Decided to go with direct
2 file upload without using torrents for the
3 following reasons: Using torrents would entail
4 seeding the files, sharing the content outside.
5 This could be legally not okay."

6 So how did Meta obtain and copy LibGen?

7 MS. HARTNETT: Object to the form.

8 THE WITNESS: So I spoke with
9 Bashlykov. We used libtorrent and the torrent
10 protocol for downloading. We had tried to
11 download a few different ways. One of them
12 included doing it via direct downloads where
13 there were individually hosted files in
14 different places and saw many issues with that
15 where files wouldn't exist, it was too slow or
16 would error out.

17 Also tried -- well, actually, the other
18 only other option was downloading via torrent,
19 and --

20 BY MS. POUEYMIROU:

21 Q. And that's what you did?

22 A. That's what we did. And the library

11/20/2024

Richard Kadrey, et al. v. Meta Platforms, Inc. Michael Clark 30(b)(6), Vol III
Highly Confidential - Attorneys' Eyes Only

Page 350

1 that we used using, LibGen -- sorry --
2 libtorrent for downloading LibGen, Bashlykov
3 modified the config setting so that the smallest
4 amount of seeding possible could occur.

5 Q. What does that mean?

6 A. When you use a torrent protocol, part
7 of the configuration on how torrents work is you
8 can only download as long as you offer to
9 participate in the torrent network in some way,
10 and seeding means that you have to open up some
11 amount of sharing of the torrent file while
12 you're downloading.

13 Q. So why did Meta decide to minimize
14 seeding the files?

15 Is it because it was concerned that
16 that was legally not okay, to quote this
17 document?

18 MS. HARTNETT: Objection to the form.

19 And to the extent it calls for any
20 attorney-client privilege, please don't reveal
21 that.

22 THE WITNESS: Yeah, I do not know what

11/20/2024

Richard Kadrey, et al. v. Meta Platforms, Inc. Michael Clark 30(b)(6), Vol III
Highly Confidential - Attorneys' Eyes Only

Page 351

1 Nikolay means in here by "legally not okay." I
2 know that legal did provide advice, which I
3 can't share. I can share what the setting was.

4 BY MS. POUEYMIROU:

5 Q. Is Bashlykov a lawyer?

6 A. No.

7 Q. Okay. So you ended up using torrent,
8 but you minimized seeding the files?

9 A. To the lowest possible setting, yes.

10 Q. Are you familiar with anti-leeching
11 protocol?

12 A. I've heard the term before.

13 In which context?

14 Q. In the context of -- with respect to
15 seeding the files.

16 Is there a relationship what Meta was
17 doing by minimizing the seeding of file with
18 leeching?

19 A. Could you be more specific?

20 Q. How do you understand anti-leeching?

21 A. I don't -- I didn't prepare on it
22 today. I would only know from my just own

11/20/2024

Richard Kadrey, et al. v. Meta Platforms, Inc. Michael Clark 30(b)(6), Vol III
Highly Confidential - Attorneys' Eyes Only

Page 352

1 personal context that leeching in torrents is
2 taking more than you give from the torrent
3 network. So having more download than you would
4 allow to upload.

5 Q. So by minimizing -- by minimizing
6 seeding the files, Meta was essentially -- what
7 does that actually mean with respect to Meta's
8 participation in sharing the files that it has
9 downloaded?

10 MS. HARTNETT: Object to the form.

11 THE WITNESS: The use of the
12 libtorrent, the configuration that Bashlykov
13 used was to download as much as possible from
14 the torrent network but to let the least amount
15 to be shared back and only for the amount of
16 time the content was being loaded and not before
17 or after.

18 BY MS. POUEYMIROU:

19 Q. And why did he not want to share back?

20 A. He was provided guidance by counsel on
21 limiting that.

22 Q. Okay.

11/20/2024

Richard Kadrey, et al. v. Meta Platforms, Inc. Michael Clark 30(b)(6), Vol III
Highly Confidential - Attorneys' Eyes Only

Page 353

1 Can you pull 52.

2 THE REPORTER: 624.

3 MS. POUEYMIROU: 624?

4 Mark that.

5 (Whereupon, Exhibit 624 was
6 marked for identification.)

7 MS. HARTNETT: 624?

8 MS. POUEYMIROU: Yeah.

9 MS. HARTNETT: Okay.

10 MS. POUEYMIROU: And before we turn to
11 that, I just had a couple more questions. Just
12 that these two relate to each other, these
13 documents.

14 THE WITNESS: Do we have the metadata
15 for this?

16 MS. POUEYMIROU: Let me see. We
17 should.

18 624A.

19 (Whereupon, Exhibit 624A was
20 marked for identification.)

21 BY MS. POUEYMIROU:

22 Q. So you said that "The use of

11/20/2024

Richard Kadrey, et al. v. Meta Platforms, Inc. Michael Clark 30(b)(6), Vol III
Highly Confidential - Attorneys' Eyes Only

Page 354

1 libtorrent, the configuration that Bashlykov
2 used was to download as much as possible from
3 the torrent network but to let the least amount
4 to be shared back and only for the amount of
5 time the content was being loaded and not before
6 or after."

7 Here he's saying that using torrent
8 might not be legally okay.

9 Was there a change in policy around
10 this time about using torrent?

11 MS. HARTNETT: Objection to the form.

12 THE WITNESS: There wasn't a specific
13 policy around using torrent that I am aware of.

14 BY MS. POUEYMIROU:

15 Q. Okay.

16 A. The guidance was to try and download
17 the file, as I can remember it, which was not
18 feasible.

19 Q. Okay.

20 A. And so torrenting was how it was
21 collected.

22 Q. And you said to set the setting on

11/20/2024

Richard Kadrey, et al. v. Meta Platforms, Inc. Michael Clark 30(b)(6), Vol III
Highly Confidential - Attorneys' Eyes Only

Page 355

1 seeding down as low as possible; is that
2 correct?

3 A. That was what Bashlykov had shared he
4 had done in the configuration setting.

5 Q. And what speed is that?

6 A. He didn't say.

7 Q. Okay. Does that mean that Meta was
8 still in a place to distribute the files that it
9 had downloaded?

10 MS. HARTNETT: Object to the form.

11 THE WITNESS: Based on torrenting,
12 while the torrent was running and content was
13 being downloaded, during that period of time,
14 yes, it would allow others to download via
15 whatever that amount of that lowest possible
16 setting was on libtorrent.

17 BY MS. POUEYMIROU:

18 Q. Okay. And you said "for the amount of
19 time the content was being loaded."

20 What does it mean to be loaded?

21 A. Sorry. To be downloaded.

22 Q. Okay.

11/20/2024

Richard Kadrey, et al. v. Meta Platforms, Inc. Michael Clark 30(b)(6), Vol III
Highly Confidential - Attorneys' Eyes Only

Page 356

1 A. While content was being downloaded from
2 torrent network -- that while content was being
3 loaded from, that is the only time it was
4 running until the complete file had been
5 downloaded and the libtorrent process was
6 terminated.

7 Q. Okay. So what you're describing, then,
8 is essentially a time period where Meta is
9 downloading all of the files from LibGen through
10 torrent, and once it has downloaded everything,
11 libtorrent ends, and it no longer is sharing the
12 data?

13 A. That is correct.

14 Q. Okay. How much data did it share?

15 A. He did not have any details, so I do
16 not know.

17 Q. How would we find that out?

18 MS. HARTNETT: I would object to beyond
19 the scope.

20 MR. STEIN: Beyond the scope of --

21 MS. HARTNETT: Of the 30(b)(6). Sorry.

22 I'm not sure how --

11/20/2024

Richard Kadrey, et al. v. Meta Platforms, Inc. Michael Clark 30(b)(6), Vol III
Highly Confidential - Attorneys' Eyes Only

Page 357

1 MR. STEIN: On the shadow libraries?

2 MS. HARTNETT: On the sharing of how
3 much sharing or non-sharing of data was
4 accomplished by the downloaded method.

5 MR. STEIN: Okay. Well, if the shadow
6 library was being downloaded and required Meta
7 to also be uploading the data at the same time
8 and kind of compound the infringement here, I
9 think it's very much in the scope.

10 MS. HARTNETT: I think he's not -- I
11 don't read the topics to include that nor I
12 don't think reasonably put him on notice, but he
13 can answer.

14 I'm not going to try to stop him from
15 answering, I'm just saying that I think that's
16 kind of beyond -- going to the edge of the topic
17 at best.

18 BY MS. POUEYMIROU:

19 Q. So how would we find out how much data
20 was shared?

21 A. I do not know. I don't have those
22 details.

11/20/2024

Richard Kadrey, et al. v. Meta Platforms, Inc. Michael Clark 30(b)(6), Vol III
Highly Confidential - Attorneys' Eyes Only

Page 394

1 record just say one thing?

2 With respect to your questioning about
3 seeding, kind of without arguing about whether
4 it's under 1 or 7, Mr. Bashlykov will be the
5 30(b)(6) witness for Topic 7, and he's prepared
6 to talk about the seeding in more detail.

7 This witness has some obvious technical
8 knowledge, but Mr. Bashlykov will be the person
9 to provide more information on that for you.

10 MS. POUEYMIROU: Okay. Thank you.

11 Q. So last week we looked at a document
12 where Eleonora Presani says LibGen is an illegal
13 pirating website.

14 Were there other employees at Meta that
15 expressed concern about using LibGen because it
16 was a pirating website?

17 MS. HARTNETT: Object to the form.

18 THE WITNESS: I am not aware of others
19 that -- I am not.

20 BY MS. POUEYMIROU:

21 Q. One of the documents you were prepared
22 with was a New York Times article which

11/20/2024

Richard Kadrey, et al. v. Meta Platforms, Inc. Michael Clark 30(b)(6), Vol III
Highly Confidential - Attorneys' Eyes Only

Page 461

1 STATE OF CALIFORNIA)

2 COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES) SS.

3 I, AUDRA E. CRAMER, CSR No. 9901, in and for the
4 State of California, do hereby certify:

5 That, prior to being examined, the witness named
6 in the foregoing deposition was by me duly sworn to
7 testify the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the
8 truth;

9 That said deposition was taken down by me in
10 shorthand at the time and place therein named, and
11 thereafter reduced to typewriting under my direction,
12 and the same is a true, correct and complete transcript
13 of said proceedings;

14 I further certify that I am not interested in the
15 event of the action.

16 Witness my hand this 22 day of November,
17 2024.

18
19
20 

Certified Shorthand

Reporter for the

State of California