

1 JOSEPH C. GRATZ (CA SBN 240676)  
 JGratz@mofo.com  
 2 TIFFANY CHEUNG (CA SBN 211497)  
 TCheung@mofo.com  
 3 JOYCE C. LI (CA SBN 323820)  
 JoyceLi@mofo.com  
 4 MELODY ELLEN WONG (CA SBN 341494)  
 MelodyWong@mofo.com  
 5 MORRISON & FOERSTER LLP  
 425 Market Street,  
 6 San Francisco, California 94105-2482  
 Telephone: (415) 268-7000  
 7 Facsimile: (415) 268-7522  
 [CAPTION CONTINUED ON NEXT PAGE]

8  
 9 Attorneys for Defendants OPENAI, INC., OPENAI, L.P., OPENAI  
 OPCO, L.L.C., OPENAI GP, L.L.C., OPENAI STARTUP FUND GP I,  
 10 L.L.C., OPENAI STARTUP FUND I, L.P., OPENAI STARTUP FUND  
 MANAGEMENT, LLC, OPENAI, L.L.C., OPENAI GLOBAL, LLC,  
 11 OAI CORPORATION, OPENAI HOLDINGS, LLC, OPENAI  
 HOLDCO, LLC, OPENAI STARTUP FUND SPV I, L.P., and OPENAI  
 12 STARTUP FUND SPV GP I, L.L.C.

13 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
 14 NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

15  
 16 J. DOE 1, et al.,  
 17 Plaintiffs,  
 18 v.  
 19 GITHUB, INC., MICROSOFT  
 CORPORATION, OPENAI, INC., et al.,  
 20 Defendants.  
 21

Case No. 4:22-cv-06823-JST  
 Case No. 4:22-cv-07074-JST

Hon. Jon S. Tigar

**DEFENDANTS' ANSWER TO  
 SECOND AMENDED COMPLAINT**

1 ALLYSON R. BENNETT (CA SBN 302090)  
ABennett@mofo.com  
2 ROSE S. LEE (CA SBN 294658)  
RoseLee@mofo.com  
3 ALEXANDRA M. WARD (CA SBN 318042)  
AlexandraWard@mofo.com  
4 MORRISON & FOERSTER LLP  
707 Wilshire Boulevard  
5 Los Angeles, California 90017-3543  
Telephone: (213) 892-5200  
6 Facsimile: (213) 892-5454+

7 MAX I. LEVY (CA SBN 346289)  
MLevy@mofo.com  
8 MORRISON & FOERSTER LLP  
755 Page Mill Road  
9 Palo Alto, CA 94304-1018  
Telephone: (650) 813-5600  
10 Facsimile: (650) 494-0792

11 ERIC K. NIKOLAIDES (*pro hac vice*)  
ENikolaides@mofo.com  
12 MORRISON & FOERSTER LLP  
250 West 55<sup>th</sup> Street  
13 New York, NY 10019-9601  
Telephone: (212) 468-8000  
14 Facsimile: (212) 468-7900

15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

1 Defendants OpenAI, Inc.; OpenAI, L.P.; OpenAI OpCo, L.L.C.; OpenAI GP, L.L.C.;  
2 OpenAI Startup Fund GP I, L.L.C.; OpenAI Startup Fund I, L.P.; OpenAI Startup Fund  
3 Management, LLC; OpenAI, L.L.C.; OpenAI Global, LLC (“OpenAI Global”); OAI Corporation  
4 (“OAI”); OpenAI Holdings, LLC (“OpenAI Holdings”); OpenAI Holdco, LLC; OpenAI Startup  
5 Fund SPV I, L.P.; and OpenAI Startup Fund SPV GP I, LLC (collectively “Defendants”), by and  
6 through the undersigned counsel, submit the following answer to the Complaint filed by Plaintiffs  
7 J. Doe 1, J. Doe 2, J. Doe 3, J. Doe 4 and J. Doe 5 (“Plaintiffs”).

8 Defendants state that the headings and sub-headings throughout the Complaint do not  
9 constitute well-pleaded allegations of fact and, therefore, require no response. To the extent a  
10 response is deemed required, Defendants deny the allegations contained in the Complaint’s  
11 headings and sub-headings.

12 Defendants deny all allegations in the Complaint that are not explicitly admitted and  
13 otherwise answers as follows:

14 **I. OVERVIEW: A BRAVE NEW WORLD**  
15 **OF SOFTWARE PIRACY**

16 1. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
17 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

18 2. OpenAI admits that artificial intelligence is a branch of computer science whose  
19 goal is to create computing systems that can behave in a way typically associated with human  
20 intelligence. OpenAI admits that machine learning is an approach to artificial intelligence where  
21 computer systems can learn to accomplish tasks based on information or experimentation, rather  
22 than being programmed step by step. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this paragraph.

23 3. To the extent the allegations in this paragraph are directed at GitHub, OpenAI  
24 lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
25 GitHub and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this  
26 paragraph.

27 4. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
28 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

1           5.       To the extent the allegations in this paragraph are directed at Microsoft, OpenAI  
2 lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
3 Microsoft and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in  
4 this paragraph.

5           6.       OpenAI admits that, in 2019, Microsoft committed to invest \$1 billion in OpenAI  
6 to support building artificial general intelligence with widely distributed economic benefits. To  
7 the extent the allegations in this paragraph are directed at Microsoft, OpenAI lacks knowledge or  
8 information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about Microsoft and on  
9 that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or  
10 deny the allegations in this paragraph related to what was “reported” by unidentified sources.  
11 OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this paragraph.

12           7.       OpenAI admits that, in 2019, Microsoft committed to invest \$1 billion in OpenAI  
13 to support building artificial general intelligence with widely distributed economic benefits.  
14 OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this paragraph.

15           8.       To the extent the allegations in this paragraph are directed at Microsoft, OpenAI  
16 lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
17 Microsoft and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this  
18 paragraph.

19           9.       OpenAI admits that OpenAI announced Codex in 2021. OpenAI admits that  
20 Codex is an artificial intelligence system that translates natural language to code. OpenAI lacks  
21 knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the remaining allegations of this paragraph,  
22 and on that basis denies them.

23           10.      Denied.

24           11.      Denied.

25           12.      To the extent the allegations in this paragraph are directed at Microsoft, OpenAI  
26 lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
27 Microsoft and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in  
28 this paragraph.

1 13. Denied.

2 14. Denied.

3 15. Denied.

4 **II. JURISDICTION AND VENUE**

5 16. OpenAI admits that Plaintiffs purport to bring this case as a class action, and that  
6 they seek injunctive relief and damages. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this  
7 paragraph.

8 17. For purposes of this action, OpenAI does not contest jurisdiction and venue.  
9 OpenAI denies any remaining allegations of this paragraph.

10 **III. INTRADISTRICT ASSIGNMENT**

11 18. For purposes of this action, OpenAI does not contest assignment of this case to the  
12 San Francisco Division of the United States District Court for the Northern District of California.  
13 OpenAI denies any remaining allegations of this paragraph.

14 **IV. PARTIES**

15 **A. Plaintiffs**

16 19. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
17 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

18 20. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
19 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

20 21. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
21 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

22 22. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
23 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

24 23. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
25 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

26 **B. Defendants**

27 24. The allegations of this paragraph are directed at GitHub, and/or OpenAI lacks  
28 knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about

1 GitHub, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this  
2 paragraph.

3 25. The allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft, and/or OpenAI lacks  
4 knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
5 Microsoft, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in  
6 this paragraph.

7 26. OpenAI admits that OpenAI, Inc. is a Delaware nonprofit corporation with a  
8 principal place of business in San Francisco, CA. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations of  
9 this paragraph.

10 27. OpenAI admits that OpenAI, L.P. was a Delaware limited partnership with a  
11 principal place of business in San Francisco, CA and is now known as OpenAI OpCo., L.L.C.  
12 OpenAI denies any remaining allegations of this paragraph.

13 28. OpenAI admits that OpenAI OpCo, L.L.C. is a Delaware limited liability company  
14 with a principal place of business in San Francisco, CA. OpenAI admits that OpenAI OpCo,  
15 L.L.C. is a research and deployment company with a mission to ensure that artificial intelligence  
16 benefits all of humanity. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations of this paragraph.

17 29. OpenAI admits that OpenAI GP, L.L.C. is a Delaware limited liability company  
18 with a principal place of business in San Francisco, CA. OpenAI denies any remaining  
19 allegations of this paragraph.

20 30. OpenAI admits that OpenAI Startup Fund I, L.P. is a Delaware limited partnership  
21 with a principal place of business in San Francisco, CA. OpenAI denies any remaining  
22 allegations of this paragraph.

23 31. OpenAI admits that OpenAI Startup Fund GP I, L.L.C. is a Delaware limited  
24 liability company with a principal place of business in San Francisco, CA. OpenAI admits that  
25 OpenAI Startup Fund GP I, L.L.C. is the general partner of OpenAI Startup Fund I, L.P. OpenAI  
26 denies any remaining allegations of this paragraph.

1           32.     OpenAI admits that OpenAI Startup Fund Management, LLC is a Delaware  
2 limited liability company with a principal place of business in San Francisco, CA. OpenAI denies  
3 any remaining allegations of this paragraph.

4           33.     OpenAI admits that OpenAI, L.L.C. is a Delaware limited liability company with a  
5 principal place of business in San Francisco, California. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations  
6 of this paragraph.

7           34.     OpenAI admits that OpenAI Global, LLC is a Delaware limited liability company  
8 with a principal place in San Francisco, California. OpenAI admits that OpenAI Global, L.L.C.'s  
9 only members are Microsoft and OAI Corporation. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations of  
10 this paragraph.

11          35.     OpenAI admits that OAI Corporation is a Delaware corporation with its principal  
12 place of business in San Francisco, California. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations of this  
13 paragraph.

14          36.     OpenAI admits that OpenAI Holdings, LLC is a Delaware limited liability  
15 company with a principal place in San Francisco, California. OpenAI admits that OpenAI, Inc.  
16 and Aestas, LLC are members of OpenAI Holdings, LLC. OpenAI denies any remaining  
17 allegations of this paragraph.

18          37.     Admitted.

19          38.     OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
20 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

21          39.     Admitted.

22          40.     OpenAI admits that OpenAI Startup Fund SPV GP I, L.L.C. is a Delaware limited  
23 liability company with a principal place in San Francisco, California. OpenAI denies any  
24 remaining allegations of this paragraph.

25                                   **V.     AGENTS AND CO-CONSPIRATORS**

26          41.     Denied.

27          42.     Denied.

28          43.     Denied.

1 44. Denied.

2 45. Denied.

3 **VI. CLASS ALLEGATIONS**

4 **A. Class Definitions**

5 46. Denied.

6 **B. Numerosity**

7 47. Denied.

8 **C. Typicality**

9 48. Denied.

10 **D. Commonality & Predominance**

11 49. Denied

12 50. Denied.

13 **E. Adequacy**

14 51. Denied.

15 **F. Other Class Considerations**

16 52. Denied.

17 53. Denied.

18 54. Denied

19 **VII. FACTUAL ALLEGATIONS**

20 **A. Introduction**

21 55. OpenAI admits that it has offered a product called Codex. OpenAI denies any  
22 remaining allegations in this paragraph.

23 56. OpenAI admits it began development of Codex after December 2015 and  
24 announced that it was releasing Codex through its API in private beta in August 2021.

25 57. To the extent the allegations in this paragraph are directed at GitHub, OpenAI  
26 lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
27 GitHub and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this  
28 paragraph.



1           58.     OpenAI admits that Codex is an artificial intelligence system that translates natural  
2 language to code. OpenAI admits that Codex’s training data includes both natural language and  
3 billions of lines of source code from publicly available sources. To the extent the allegations in  
4 this paragraph are directed at GitHub, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit  
5 or deny the allegations of this paragraph about GitHub and on that basis OpenAI denies them.  
6 OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this paragraph.

7           59.     OpenAI admits that Codex was made available to GitHub to develop Copilot as  
8 part of a partnership between the two companies. OpenAI admits that the language quoted in the  
9 allegation can be found in the August 10, 2021 “OpenAI Codex” blog post on OpenAI’s publicly  
10 available website. The blog post speaks for itself. To the extent the allegations in this paragraph  
11 are directed at GitHub, OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the  
12 allegations of this paragraph about GitHub and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies  
13 any remaining allegations in this paragraph.

14           **B.     Codex Outputs Copyrighted Materials Without Following the Terms of the**  
15           **Applicable Licenses**

16           60.     OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
17 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

18           61.     OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
19 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

20           62.     OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
21 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

22           63.     OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
23 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

24           64.     OpenAI admits that Codex is an artificial intelligence system that translates natural  
25 language to code. OpenAI admits that Codex’s training data includes both natural language and  
26 billions of lines of source code from publicly available sources. OpenAI admits that training a  
27 model teaches programming language to a model by showing the model a wide range of natural  
28 language and software code. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this paragraph.

1           65.     Denied.

2           66.     OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
3 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

4           67.     OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
5 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

6           68.     Denied.

7           69.     OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
8 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

9           70.     OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
10 of this paragraph with respect to Haverbeke’s purpose, and on that basis denies them. OpenAI  
11 denies any remaining allegations in this paragraph.

12          71.     OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
13 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

14          72.     Denied.

15          73.     OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
16 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

17          74.     To the extent the allegations in this paragraph purport to quote from portions of the  
18 MIT license, the full text of that license speaks for itself. OpenAI denies any remaining  
19 allegations in this paragraph.

20          75.     To the extent the allegations in this paragraph purport to quote from portions of a  
21 publicly available research paper, the full text of that research paper speaks for itself. OpenAI  
22 denies any remaining allegations of this paragraph.

23          76.     To the extent the allegations in this paragraph purport to refer to the contents of  
24 open-source licenses, including the Suggested Licenses, the full texts of those licenses speak for  
25 themselves. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny any remaining  
26 allegations in this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

27          77.     Denied.

28

1           **C.     Copilot Outputs Copyrighted Materials Without Following the Terms of the**  
2           **Applicable Licenses**

3           78.     The allegations of this paragraph are directed at GitHub, and/or OpenAI lacks  
4 knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
5 GitHub, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this  
6 paragraph.

7           79.     The allegations of this paragraph are directed at GitHub, and/or OpenAI lacks  
8 knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
9 GitHub, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this  
10 paragraph.

11           80.     OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
12 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

13           81.     OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
14 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

15           82.     OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
16 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

17           83.     OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
18 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

19           84.     OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
20 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

21           85.     OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
22 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

23           86.     OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
24 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

25           87.     OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
26 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

27           88.     OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
28 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

1           89.     OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
2 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

3           **D.     Codex and Copilot Were Trained on Copyrighted Materials Offered Under**  
4           **Licenses**

5           90.     OpenAI admits that Codex is an artificial intelligence system. OpenAI lacks  
6 knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the remaining allegations of this paragraph,  
7 and on that basis denies them.

8           91.     OpenAI admits that Codex is an artificial intelligence system that translates natural  
9 language to code. OpenAI admits that Codex’s training data includes both natural language and  
10 billions of lines of source code from publicly available sources. OpenAI admits that training the  
11 Codex model teaches programming language to it by showing the model a wide range of natural  
12 language and software code, and, utilizing sophisticated statistical and computational analysis,  
13 having it try to predict the snippet of code that comes next in each of a huge range of software  
14 code. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations directed to OpenAI in this paragraph.

15           92.     Denied.

16           93.     OpenAI admits that models are computer programs that are developed using  
17 artificial intelligence and machine learning techniques. OpenAI admits that training the Codex  
18 model teaches programming language to it by showing the model a wide range of natural  
19 language and software code, and, utilizing sophisticated statistical and computational analysis,  
20 having it try to predict the snippet of code that comes next in each of a huge range of software  
21 code. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations directed to OpenAI in this paragraph.

22           **E.     Copilot Was Launched Despite Its Propensity for Producing Unlawful**  
23           **Outputs**

24           94.     OpenAI admits that Codex was trained on code in public GitHub repositories.  
25 OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this paragraph.

26           95.     OpenAI admits that that certain language quoted in the allegation can be found in  
27 the August 10, 2021 “OpenAI Codex” blog post on OpenAI’s publicly available website. The  
28 blog post speaks for itself. To the extent the allegations in this paragraph purport to quote from

1 portions of publicly available websites unaffiliated with OpenAI, the full contents of those  
2 websites speak for themselves. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this paragraph.

3 96. The allegations of this paragraph are directed at GitHub, and/or OpenAI lacks  
4 knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
5 GitHub, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this  
6 paragraph.

7 97. To the extent the allegations in this paragraph purport to quote from a post on a  
8 publicly available website unaffiliated with OpenAI, the full text of that post speaks for itself.  
9 OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this paragraph.

10 98. To the extent the allegations in this paragraph purport to quote from a blog post a  
11 publicly available website unaffiliated with OpenAI, the full text of that post speaks for itself.  
12 OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this paragraph.

13 99. The allegations of this paragraph are directed at GitHub, and/or OpenAI lacks  
14 knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
15 GitHub, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this  
16 paragraph.

17 100. The allegations of this paragraph are directed at GitHub, and/or OpenAI lacks  
18 knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
19 GitHub, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this  
20 paragraph.

21 101. To the extent the allegations in this paragraph purport to quote from a post on a  
22 publicly available website unaffiliated with OpenAI, the full text of that post speaks for itself.  
23 OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this paragraph.

24 102. To the extent the allegations in this paragraph purport to quote from a post on a  
25 publicly available website unaffiliated with OpenAI, the full text of that post speaks for itself.  
26 OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this paragraph.

27 103. The allegations of this paragraph are directed at GitHub, and/or OpenAI lacks  
28 knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about

1 GitHub, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this  
2 paragraph.

3 104. To the extent the allegations in this paragraph purport to quote from a publicly  
4 available study unaffiliated with OpenAI, the full text of that study speaks for itself. OpenAI  
5 denies any remaining allegations in this paragraph.

6 105. Denied.

7 106. The allegations of this paragraph are directed at GitHub, and/or OpenAI lacks  
8 knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
9 GitHub, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this  
10 paragraph.

11 107. The allegations of this paragraph are directed at GitHub, and/or OpenAI lacks  
12 knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
13 GitHub, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this  
14 paragraph.

15 108. The allegations of this paragraph are directed at GitHub, and/or OpenAI lacks  
16 knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
17 GitHub, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this  
18 paragraph.

19 **F. Copilot Reproduces the Code of the Named Plaintiffs Without Attribution**

20 109. Denied.

21 110. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
22 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

23 111. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
24 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

25 **1. Example: Copilot Outputs the Code of Doe 2 Essentially Verbatim**

26 112. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
27 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

28

1           113. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
2 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

3           114. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
4 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

5           115. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
6 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

7           116. Denied.

8                           **2. Example: Copilot Outputs the Code of Doe 1 in Modified Format**

9           117. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
10 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

11           118. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
12 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

13           119. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
14 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

15           120. Denied.

16           121. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
17 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

18           122. Denied.

19           123. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
20 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

21           124. Denied.

22                           **3. Example: Copilot Outputs the Code of Doe 5 In Modified Format**

23           125. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
24 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

25           126. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
26 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

27           127. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
28 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

1           128. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
2 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

3           129. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
4 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

5           130. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
6 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

7           131. Denied.

8           132. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
9 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

10                   **4. Example: Copilot Outputs Code of Doe 5 Essentially Verbatim**

11           133. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
12 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

13           134. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
14 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

15           135. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
16 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

17           136. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
18 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

19           137. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
20 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

21           138. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
22 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

23           139. Denied.

24           140. OpenAI admits that it developed Codex. To the extent any allegations in this  
25 paragraph are not directed at OpenAI, they are directed at GitHub, and/or OpenAI lacks  
26 knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
27 GitHub, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this  
28 paragraph.



1           **G. Codex and Copilot Were Designed to Withhold Attribution, Copyright**  
2           **Notices, and License Terms from Their Users**

3           141. OpenAI denies the allegations in this paragraph to the extent they refer to Codex.  
4           The remaining allegations of this paragraph are directed at GitHub, and/or OpenAI lacks  
5           knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
6           GitHub, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this  
7           paragraph.

8           142. Certain allegations of this paragraph are directed at GitHub, and/or OpenAI lacks  
9           knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
10          GitHub, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information  
11          sufficient to admit or deny the remaining allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies  
12          them.

13          143. The allegations of this paragraph are directed at GitHub, and/or OpenAI lacks  
14          knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
15          GitHub, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this  
16          paragraph.

17          144. The allegations of this paragraph are directed at GitHub, and/or OpenAI lacks  
18          knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
19          GitHub, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this  
20          paragraph.

21          145. The allegations of this paragraph are directed at GitHub, and/or OpenAI lacks  
22          knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
23          GitHub, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this  
24          paragraph.

25          146. The allegations of this paragraph are directed at GitHub, and/or OpenAI lacks  
26          knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
27          GitHub, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this  
28          paragraph.

1           147. OpenAI denies the allegations in this paragraph to the extent they refer to Codex.  
2 The remaining allegations of this paragraph are directed at GitHub, and/or OpenAI lacks  
3 knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
4 GitHub, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this  
5 paragraph.

6           148. The allegations of this paragraph are directed at GitHub, and/or OpenAI lacks  
7 knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
8 GitHub, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this  
9 paragraph.

10           149. The allegations of this paragraph are directed at GitHub, and/or OpenAI lacks  
11 knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
12 GitHub, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this  
13 paragraph.

14           150. The allegations of this paragraph are directed at GitHub, and/or OpenAI lacks  
15 knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
16 GitHub, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this  
17 paragraph.

18           151. The allegations of this paragraph are directed at GitHub, and/or OpenAI lacks  
19 knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
20 GitHub, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this  
21 paragraph.

22           152. The allegations of this paragraph are directed at GitHub, and/or OpenAI lacks  
23 knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
24 GitHub, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this  
25 paragraph.

26           153. The allegations of this paragraph are directed at GitHub, and/or OpenAI lacks  
27 knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
28

1 GitHub, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this  
2 paragraph.

3 154. The allegations of this paragraph are directed at GitHub, and/or OpenAI lacks  
4 knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
5 GitHub, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this  
6 paragraph.

7 155. The allegations of this paragraph are directed at GitHub, and/or OpenAI lacks  
8 knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
9 GitHub, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this  
10 paragraph.

11 156. The allegations of this paragraph are directed at GitHub, and/or OpenAI lacks  
12 knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
13 GitHub, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this  
14 paragraph.

15 157. The allegations of this paragraph are directed at GitHub, and/or OpenAI lacks  
16 knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
17 GitHub, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this  
18 paragraph.

19 **H. Open-Source Licenses Began to Appear in the Early 1990s**

20 158. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
21 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

22 159. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
23 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

24 160. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
25 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

26 161. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
27 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

28

1           162. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
2 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

3           163. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
4 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

5           164. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
6 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

7           165. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
8 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

9           **I. Microsoft Has a History of Flouting Open-Source License Requirements**

10           166. The allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft, and/or OpenAI lacks  
11 knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
12 Microsoft, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in  
13 this paragraph.

14           167. The allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft, and/or OpenAI lacks  
15 knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
16 Microsoft, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in  
17 this paragraph.

18           168. The allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft, and/or OpenAI lacks  
19 knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
20 Microsoft, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in  
21 this paragraph.

22           169. The allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft, and/or OpenAI lacks  
23 knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
24 Microsoft, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in  
25 this paragraph.

26           170. The allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft, and/or OpenAI lacks  
27 knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
28

1 Microsoft, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in  
2 this paragraph.

3 171. The allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft, and/or OpenAI lacks  
4 knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
5 Microsoft, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in  
6 this paragraph.

7 172. The allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft, and/or OpenAI lacks  
8 knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
9 Microsoft, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in  
10 this paragraph.

11 173. The allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft, and/or OpenAI lacks  
12 knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
13 Microsoft, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in  
14 this paragraph.

15 174. The allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft, and/or OpenAI lacks  
16 knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
17 Microsoft, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in  
18 this paragraph.

19 175. The allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft, and/or OpenAI lacks  
20 knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
21 Microsoft, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in  
22 this paragraph.

23 **J. GitHub Was Designed to Cater to Open-Source Projects**

24 176. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
25 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

26 177. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
27 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

28

1           178. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
2 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

3           179. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
4 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

5           180. The allegations of this paragraph are directed at GitHub, and/or OpenAI lacks  
6 knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
7 GitHub, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this  
8 paragraph.

9           181. The allegations of this paragraph are directed at GitHub, and/or OpenAI lacks  
10 knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
11 GitHub, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this  
12 paragraph.

13           182. OpenAI denies the allegations in this paragraph to the extent they refer to Codex.  
14 The remaining allegations of this paragraph are directed at GitHub, and/or OpenAI lacks  
15 knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
16 GitHub, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this  
17 paragraph.

18           183. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
19 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

20           184. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
21 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

22           185. The allegations of this paragraph are directed at GitHub, and/or OpenAI lacks  
23 knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
24 GitHub, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this  
25 paragraph.

26           186. The allegations of this paragraph are directed at GitHub, and/or OpenAI lacks  
27 knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
28

1 GitHub, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this  
2 paragraph.

3 187. The allegations of this paragraph are directed at GitHub and/or Microsoft, and/or  
4 OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this  
5 paragraph about GitHub and/or Microsoft, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies  
6 any remaining allegations in this paragraph.

7 **K. OpenAI Is Intertwined with Microsoft and GitHub**

8 188. OpenAI admits that OpenAI, Inc. is a nonprofit corporation founded in December  
9 2015 by a group including Greg Brockman, Ilya Sutskever, Elon Musk, and Sam Altman.  
10 OpenAI denies that Reid Hoffman is a current board member of OpenAI, Inc. The allegations  
11 that Mr. Hoffman is founder of LinkedIn, that LinkedIn is a Microsoft subsidiary, and that Mr.  
12 Hoffman also a member of the Microsoft Board of Directors are directed at Microsoft, and/or  
13 OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations about  
14 Microsoft, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in  
15 this paragraph.

16 189. OpenAI admits that it partnered with Microsoft in 2016. To the extent the  
17 allegation purports to quote from a public statement made by OpenAI, the public statement  
18 speaks for itself. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this paragraph.

19 190. To the extent the allegation purports to quote from a public statement made by  
20 OpenAI, the public statement speaks for itself. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this  
21 paragraph.

22 191. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information about what was “reported[]” by unnamed  
23 sources sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph, and on that basis denies  
24 them.

25 192. To the extent the allegations in this paragraph purport to quote from portions of a  
26 publicly available website unaffiliated with OpenAI, the full content of that website speaks for  
27 itself. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this paragraph.

28

1           193. OpenAI admits that OpenAI, LP was created to increase OpenAI’s ability to raise  
2 capital while still serving its mission. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this paragraph.

3           194. OpenAI admits that, in 2019, Microsoft committed to invest \$1 billion in OpenAI  
4 to support building artificial general intelligence with widely distributed economic benefits.  
5 OpenAI admits that OpenAI uses the Azure cloud platform for deep learning and AI. To the  
6 extent the allegations in this paragraph purport to quote from a publicly available website, the full  
7 content of that website speaks for itself. OpenAI denies the remaining allegations of this  
8 paragraph.

9           195. The allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft, and/or OpenAI lacks  
10 knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
11 Microsoft, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in  
12 this paragraph.

13           196. OpenAI admits that Microsoft and OpenAI jointly developed Azure AI  
14 supercomputing technologies. To the extent the allegations in this paragraph purport to quote  
15 from portions of publicly available websites unaffiliated with OpenAI, the full contents of those  
16 websites speak for themselves. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this paragraph.

17           197. OpenAI admits that GPT-3 is a large language model. OpenAI admits that Codex  
18 is a descendant of GPT-3 and that its training data contains both natural language and billions of  
19 lines of source code from publicly available sources. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in  
20 this paragraph. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this paragraph.

21           198. OpenAI admits that Codex is the model that powers GitHub Copilot, which  
22 OpenAI built and launched in partnership with GitHub. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations  
23 in this paragraph.

24           199. OpenAI admits that it released DALL-E 2 as a research preview in 2022. OpenAI  
25 denies the remaining allegations of this paragraph.

26           200. To the extent the allegations in this paragraph purport to quote from publicly  
27 available websites unaffiliated with OpenAI, the full texts of those websites speak for themselves.  
28 OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this paragraph.



**L. Conclusion of Factual Allegations**

201. Denied.

202. Denied.

203. Denied.

**VIII. CLAIMS FOR RELIEF**

**COUNT 1**

**VIOLATION OF THE DIGITAL MILLENNIUM COPYRIGHT ACT**

**17 U.S.C. §§ 1201–1205**

**(For Injunctive Relief)**

**(Against All Defendants)**

204. OpenAI incorporates by reference its responses to all allegations set forth in paragraphs 1–203 as if fully set forth herein.

205. Denied.

206. Denied.

207. The allegations of this paragraph are directed at GitHub, and/or OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about GitHub, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this paragraph.

208. The allegations of this paragraph are directed at GitHub, and/or OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about GitHub, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this paragraph.

209. The allegations of this paragraph are directed at GitHub, and/or OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about GitHub, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this paragraph.

210. OpenAI denies the allegations in this paragraph to the extent they refer to Codex. The remaining allegations of this paragraph are directed at GitHub and/or Microsoft, and/or OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this

1 paragraph about GitHub and/or Microsoft, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies  
2 any remaining allegations in this paragraph.

3 211. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
4 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

5 212. Denied.

6 213. Denied.

7 214. Denied.

8 215. Denied.

9 216. Denied.

10 217. Denied.

11 218. Denied.

12 219. Denied.

13 220. Denied.

14 221. Denied.

15 222. Denied.

16 223. Denied.

17 224. Denied.

18 225. OpenAI denies the allegations in this paragraph to the extent they refer to OpenAI.  
19 The remaining allegations of this paragraph are directed at GitHub and/or Microsoft, and/or  
20 OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this  
21 paragraph about GitHub and/or Microsoft, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies  
22 any remaining allegations in this paragraph.

23 226. Denied.

24 227. Denied.

25 228. Denied.

26 229. OpenAI denies the allegations in this paragraph to the extent they are directed at  
27 OpenAI. The remaining allegations of this paragraph are directed at Microsoft, and/or OpenAI  
28 lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about

1 GitHub and/or Microsoft, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining  
2 allegations in this paragraph.

3 230. OpenAI denies the allegations in this paragraph to the extent they are directed at  
4 OpenAI. The remaining allegations of this paragraph are directed at GitHub, and/or OpenAI  
5 lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
6 GitHub, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this  
7 paragraph.

8 231. The allegations of this paragraph are directed at GitHub, and/or OpenAI lacks  
9 knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
10 GitHub, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this  
11 paragraph.

12 232. The allegations of this paragraph are directed at GitHub, and/or OpenAI lacks  
13 knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
14 GitHub, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this  
15 paragraph.

16 233. Denied.

17 234. Denied.

18 235. Denied.

19 **COUNT 2**  
20 **BREACH OF CONTRACT—OPEN-SOURCE LICENSE VIOLATIONS**  
21 **California Common Law**  
22 **(Against All Defendants)**

23 236. OpenAI incorporates by reference its responses to all allegations set forth in  
24 paragraphs 1–234 as if fully set forth herein.

25 237. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
26 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

27 238. OpenAI denies the allegations in this paragraph to the extent they are directed at  
28 OpenAI. The remaining allegations of this paragraph are directed at GitHub, and/or OpenAI  
lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about

1 GitHub, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this  
2 paragraph.

3 239. OpenAI denies the allegations in this paragraph to the extent they are directed at  
4 OpenAI. The remaining allegations of this paragraph are directed at GitHub, and/or OpenAI  
5 lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
6 GitHub, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this  
7 paragraph.

8 240. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
9 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

10 241. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
11 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

12 242. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
13 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

14 243. OpenAI lacks knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations  
15 of this paragraph, and on that basis denies them.

16 244. Denied.

17 245. Denied.

18 246. Denied.

19 247. Denied.

20 248. Denied.

21 249. Denied.

22 250. Denied.

23 251. Denied.

24 **COUNT 3**  
25 **BREACH OF CONTRACT — SELLING LICENSED MATERIALS**  
26 **IN VIOLATION OF GITHUB'S POLICIES**  
27 **California Common Law**  
28 **(Against GitHub)**

29 252. OpenAI incorporates by reference its responses to all allegations set forth in  
30 paragraphs 1–251 as if fully set forth herein.

1           253. The allegations of this paragraph are directed at GitHub, and/or OpenAI lacks  
2 knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
3 GitHub, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this  
4 paragraph.

5           254. The allegations of this paragraph are directed at GitHub, and/or OpenAI lacks  
6 knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
7 GitHub, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this  
8 paragraph.

9           255. The allegations of this paragraph are directed at GitHub, and/or OpenAI lacks  
10 knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
11 GitHub, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this  
12 paragraph.

13           256. The allegations of this paragraph are directed at GitHub, and/or OpenAI lacks  
14 knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
15 GitHub, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this  
16 paragraph.

17           257. The allegations of this paragraph are directed at GitHub, and/or OpenAI lacks  
18 knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
19 GitHub, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this  
20 paragraph.

21           258. The allegations of this paragraph are directed at GitHub, and/or OpenAI lacks  
22 knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
23 GitHub, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this  
24 paragraph.

25           259. The allegations of this paragraph are directed at GitHub, and/or OpenAI lacks  
26 knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
27 GitHub, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this  
28 paragraph.

1           260. The allegations of this paragraph are directed at GitHub, and/or OpenAI lacks  
2 knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
3 GitHub, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this  
4 paragraph.

5           261. The allegations of this paragraph are directed at GitHub, and/or OpenAI lacks  
6 knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
7 GitHub, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this  
8 paragraph.

9           262. The allegations of this paragraph are directed at GitHub, and/or OpenAI lacks  
10 knowledge or information sufficient to admit or deny the allegations of this paragraph about  
11 GitHub, and on that basis OpenAI denies them. OpenAI denies any remaining allegations in this  
12 paragraph.

#### 13   IX. DEMAND FOR JUDGMENT

14           **WHEREFORE**, Plaintiffs requests that the Court enter judgment on their behalf and on  
15 behalf of the Class defined herein, by adjudging and decreeing that:

16           263. In response to the Demand for Judgment, OpenAI denies that Plaintiffs are entitled  
17 to the requested relief, or to any relief whatsoever.

18           264. In response to the Demand for Judgment, OpenAI denies that Plaintiffs are entitled  
19 to the requested relief, or to any relief whatsoever.

20           265. In response to the Demand for Judgment, OpenAI denies that Plaintiffs are entitled  
21 to the requested relief, or to any relief whatsoever.

22           266. In response to the Demand for Judgment, OpenAI denies that Plaintiffs are entitled  
23 to the requested relief, or to any relief whatsoever.

24           267. In response to the Demand for Judgment, OpenAI denies that Plaintiffs are entitled  
25 to the requested relief, or to any relief whatsoever.

#### 26   X. JURY TRIAL DEMANDED

27           With respect to the jury demand contained in Plaintiffs' Complaint, OpenAI states that no  
28 response is required. To the extent a response is deemed required, OpenAI denies that all of

1 Plaintiffs' claims are properly triable to a jury.

2 **XI. AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES**

3 In further answer to the allegations made by Plaintiffs in the Second Amended Complaint,  
4 OpenAI asserts the following affirmative defenses. OpenAI does not concede that it has the  
5 burden of proof on the defenses listed below:

6 **FIRST AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE**

7 Plaintiffs' and/or putative Class Members' claim for breach of contract is preempted, in  
8 whole or in part, by the Copyright Act, 17 U.S.C. § 101 *et seq.*

9 **SECOND AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE**

10 Plaintiffs' and/or putative Class Members' claim for breach of contract fails, in whole or  
11 in part, for failure of performance by Plaintiffs.

12 **THIRD AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE**

13 Plaintiffs' and/or putative Class Members' claim for breach of contract is barred, in whole  
14 or in part, by the doctrine of impracticability.

15 **FOURTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE**

16 Plaintiffs' and/or putative Class Members' claim for breach of contract fails, in whole or  
17 in part, for lack or failure of consideration.

18 **FIFTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE**

19 Plaintiffs' and/or putative Class Members' claim for breach of contract fails, in whole or  
20 in part, for lack of contract formation.

21 **SIXTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE**

22 Plaintiffs' and/or putative Class Members' claim for breach of contract fails, in whole or  
23 in part, for lack of occurrence of a condition precedent.

24 **SEVENTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE**

25 Plaintiffs' and/or putative Class Members' claim for breach of contract fails, in whole or  
26 in part, for failure to state a claim.

27 **EIGHTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE**

28 Plaintiffs' and/or putative Class Members' claim for breach of contract fails, in whole or

1 in part, because there is no breach, including without limitation because there was no use of  
2 Plaintiffs' code in a fashion requiring copyright permission, including without limitation because  
3 the asserted use of Plaintiffs' code constitutes fair use.

4 **NINTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE**

5 Plaintiffs' and/or putative Class Members' claim for breach of contract fails, in whole or  
6 in part, because Plaintiffs have suffered no damages.

7 **TENTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE**

8 Plaintiffs' and/or putative Class Members' claim for breach of contract is barred, in whole  
9 or in part, by one or more equitable doctrines, such as estoppel, unclean hands, or waiver.

10 **ELEVENTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE**

11 Plaintiffs' and/or putative Class Members' claim for breach of contract fails, in whole or  
12 in part, due to Plaintiffs' failure to mitigate damages.

13 **TWELFTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE**

14 To the extent the alleged contract requires misattribution of ownership, the alleged  
15 contract is void as against public policy, because it is in contravention of or violates the spirit of,  
16 without limitation, Cal. Civ. Code §§ 1643, 1667, 1709, 1710, and/or 17 U.S.C. § 1202(a).

17 **THIRTEENTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE**

18 Plaintiffs' and/or putative Class Members' demand for equitable relief is barred by  
19 operation of Cal. Civ. Code § 3390(e).

20 **FOURTEENTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE**

21 Plaintiffs and/or putative Class Members cannot seek equitable relief because they have  
22 alleged an adequate remedy at law. Given Plaintiffs' allegations, Plaintiffs and/or putative Class  
23 Members cannot seek equitable relief.

24 **FIFTEENTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE**

25 Plaintiffs and/or putative Class Members' claim is barred because Plaintiffs and/or  
26 putative Class Members have not suffered any injury from the conduct alleged in the Second  
27 Amended Complaint.

28 **SIXTEENTH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE**



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

Plaintiffs' claims and the putative class members' claims fail are barred, in whole or in part, by the doctrine of consent.

**SEVENTEETH AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSE**

Plaintiffs' claims and the putative class members' claims fail, in whole or in part, because the alleged damages, if any, were the result of one or more intervening or superseding causes or caused by the acts and/or omissions of persons other than OpenAI.

1 Dated: July 22, 2024

MORRISON & FOERSTER LLP

2  
3 By: /s/ Joseph C. Gratz  
4 JOSEPH C. GRATZ

5 JOSEPH C. GRATZ  
6 JGratz@mofo.com  
7 TIFFANY CHEUNG  
8 TCheung@mofo.com  
9 MELODY E. WONG  
10 MelodyWong@mofo.com  
11 MORRISON & FOERSTER LLP  
12 425 Market Street  
13 San Francisco, California 94105-2482  
14 Telephone: (415) 268-7000  
15 Facsimile: (415) 268-7522

16 ALLYSON R. BENNETT  
17 ABennett@mofo.com  
18 ROSE S. LEE  
19 RoseLee@mofo.com  
20 ALEXANDRA M. WARD  
21 AlexandraWard@mofo.com  
22 MORRISON & FOERSTER LLP  
23 707 Wilshire Boulevard  
24 Los Angeles, California 90017-3543  
25 Telephone: (213) 892-5200  
26 Facsimile: (213) 892-5454

27 MAX I. LEVY  
28 MLevy@mofo.com  
MORRISON & FOERSTER LLP  
755 Page Mill Road  
Palo Alto, CA 94304-1018  
Telephone: (650) 813-5600  
Facsimile: (650) 494-0792

ERIC K. NIKOLAIDES (*pro hac vice*)  
ENikolaides@mofo.com  
MORRISON & FOERSTER LLP  
250 West 55<sup>th</sup> Street  
New York, NY 10019-9601  
Telephone: (212) 468-8000  
Facsimile: (212) 468-7900  
Attorneys for Defendants OPENAI, INC.,  
OPENAI, L.P., OPENAI OPCO, L.L.C.,  
OPENAI GP, L.L.C., OPENAI STARTUP  
FUND GP I, L.L.C., OPENAI STARTUP  
FUND I, L.P., OPENAI STARTUP FUND  
MANAGEMENT, LLC, OPENAI, L.L.C.,  
OPENAI GLOBAL, LLC, OAI  
CORPORATION, OPENAI HOLDINGS,  
LLC, OPENAI HOLDCO, LLC, OPENAI

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

STARTUP FUND SPV I, L.P., and OPENAI  
STARTUP FUND SPV GP I, L.L.C.