

**IN THE UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS
FOR THE FIRST CIRCUIT**

STATE OF NEW YORK; STATE OF WASHINGTON;
STATE OF RHODE ISLAND; STATE OF ARIZONA;
STATE OF CALIFORNIA; STATE OF COLORADO;
STATE OF CONNECTICUT; STATE OF DELAWARE;
DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA; STATE OF HAWAII;
STATE OF ILLINOIS; STATE OF MAINE; STATE OF
MARYLAND; COMMONWEALTH OF
MASSACHUSETTS; STATE OF MICHIGAN; STATE OF
MINNESOTA; STATE OF NEVADA; STATE OF NEW
JERSEY; STATE OF NEW MEXICO; STATE OF
OREGON; STATE OF VERMONT; STATE OF
WISCONSIN,

Plaintiffs-Appellees,

v.

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE; PAMELA BONDI, in
her official capacity as ATTORNEY GENERAL OF THE
UNITED STATES; U.S. DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH
AND HUMAN SERVICES; ROBERT F. KENNEDY, JR.,
in his official capacity as SECRETARY OF THE U.S.
DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH AND HUMAN SERVICES;
U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION; LINDA
McMAHON, in her official capacity as SECRETARY OF
THE U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION; U.S.
DEPARTMENT OF LABOR; LORI CHAVEZ-
DeREMÉR, in her official capacity as SECRETARY OF
THE U.S. DEPARTMENT OF LABOR,

Defendants-Appellants.

No. 25-2099

JOINT STIPULATION TO DISMISS APPEAL

Pursuant to Federal Rule of Appellate Procedure 42(b)(1), the parties hereby stipulate to the dismissal of this appeal, with each side to bear their own fees and costs.

DECEMBER 10, 2025

RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED,

s/ Andrew M. Bernie
ANDREW M. BERNIE
Attorney, Appellate Staff
Civil Division
U.S. Department of Justice
950 Pennsylvania Avenue NW
Washington, DC 20530
(202) 514-3411
andrew.bernie@usdoj.gov

Attorney for Defendants-Appellants

LETITIA JAMES
Attorney General for the State of New York

By: *s/ Philip Levitz*

Philip Levitz*
Senior Assistant Solicitor General
Rabia Muqaddam*
Chief Counsel for Federal Initiatives
Jessica Ranucci*
Special Counsel
Zoe Levine*
Special Counsel for Immigrant Justice
28 Liberty St.
New York, NY 10005
(929) 638-0447
rabia.muqaddam@ag.ny.gov
zoe.levine@ag.ny.gov
jessica.ranucci@ag.ny.gov

Attorneys for the State of New York

NICHOLAS W. BROWN
Attorney General of Washington

By: *s/ Andrew Hughes*

Andrew Hughes*
Benjamin Seel*
Zane Muller*
Assistant Attorneys General
Cristina Sepe*
Deputy Solicitor General
800 Fifth Avenue, Suite 2000
Seattle, WA 98104-3188
(206) 464-7744
Andrew.Hughes@atg.wa.gov
Benjamin.Seel@atg.wa.gov
Zane.Muller@atg.wa.gov
Cristina.Sepe@atg.wa.gov

Attorneys for the State of Washington

PETER F. NERONHA

Attorney General for the State of Rhode Island

By: /s/ Sarah W. Rice

Sarah W. Rice (RI No. 10588)
Stephen N. Provazza (RI No. 10435)
Unit Chief, Consumer & Economic Justice Unit
150 South Main St.
Providence, RI 02903
Phone: 401-274-4400
SRice@riag.ri.gov
SProvazza@riag.ri.gov

Attorneys for the State of Rhode Island

PHILIP J. WEISER

Attorney General for the State of Colorado

By: /s/ David Moskowitz

David Moskowitz*
Deputy Solicitor General
Jennifer L. Sullivan*
Deputy Attorney General
Colorado Department of Law
1300 Broadway, 10th Floor
Denver, CO 80203
Phone: (720) 508-6000
david.moskowitz@coag.gov
jen.sullivan@coag.gov

Attorneys for the State of Colorado

KATHLEEN JENNINGS

KRISTIN K. MAYES

Attorney General for the State of Arizona

By: /s/ Hayleigh S. Crawford

Hayleigh S. Crawford*
Mary M. Curtin*
2005 North Central Avenue
Phoenix, Arizona 85004
Phone: (602) 542-3333
Hayleigh.Crawford@azag.gov
Mary.Curtin@azag.gov
ACL@azag.gov

Attorneys for the State of Arizona

ROB BONTA

Attorney General for the State of California

By: /s/ Heidi Lehrman

Heidi Lehrman*
Neli Palma*
Michael L. Newman
Senior Assistant Attorneys General
Kathleen Boergers*
Srividya Panchalam*
Supervising Deputy Attorneys General
Heidi Lehrman*
Jeanelly Orozco Alcalá*
Natasha A. Reyes*
Deputy Attorneys General
1300 I Street
Sacramento CA 95814
Heidi.Lehrman@doj.ca.gov
Michael.Newman@doj.ca.gov
Neli.Palma@doj.ca.gov
Kathleen.Boergers@doj.ca.gov
Srividya.Panchalam@doj.ca.gov
Jeanelly.OrozcoAlcala@doj.ca.gov
Natasha.Reyes@doj.ca.gov

Attorneys for the State of California

WILLIAM TONG

Attorney General of the State of Delaware

By: /s/ Vanessa L. Kassab
Ian R. Liston
Director of Impact Litigation
Vanessa L. Kassab
Deputy Attorney General
Rose Gibson
Assistant Attorney General
Delaware Department of Justice
820 N. French Street
Wilmington, DE 19801
(302) 683-8899
vanessa.kassab@delaware.gov

Attorneys for the State of Delaware

BRIAN L. SCHWALB

Attorney General for the District of
Columbia
By: /s/ Mitchell P. Reich
Mitchell P. Reich
Senior Counsel to the Attorney General
Office of the Attorney General for the
District of Columbia
400 Sixth Street, NW
Washington, D.C. 20001
(202) 279-1261
mitchell.reich@dc.gov

Attorney for the District of Columbia

ANTHONY G. BROWN

Attorney General for the State of Maryland
By: /s Virginia A. Williamson
Virginia A. Williamson*
Assistant Attorney General
Office of the Attorney General
200 Saint Paul Place, 20th Floor

Attorney General for the State of
Connecticut

By: /s/ Patricia McCooey
Patricia McCooey*
Assistant Attorney General
165 Capitol Ave
Hartford, CT 06106
(860) 808-5210
Patricia.McCooey@ct.gov

Attorney for the State of Connecticut

KWAME RAOUL

Attorney General for the State of Illinois
By: /s/ Sarah J. North
Sarah J. North*
*Deputy Division Chief, Public Interest
Division*
Holly Berlin*
Elena Meth*
*Assistant Attorneys General, Special
Litigation Bureau*
Office of the Illinois Attorney General
115 S. LaSalle Street
Chicago, IL 60603
312-814-3000
Sarah.North@ilag.gov
Holly.Berlin@ilag.gov
Elena.Meth@ilag.gov

Attorneys for the State of Illinois

ANNE E. LOPEZ

Attorney General for the State of Hawai'i
By: /s Kaliko 'onālani D. Fernandes
David D. Day*
Special Assistant to the Attorney General
Kaliko' onālani D. Fernandes*

Baltimore, Maryland 21202
410-576-6584
VWilliamson@oag.state.md.us

Attorney for the State of Maryland

DANA NESSEL
Attorney General of Michigan

By: /s/ Neil Giovanatti
Neil Giovanatti*
Bryan Beach*
Assistant Attorneys General
Michigan Department of Attorney General
525 W. Ottawa
Lansing, MI 48909
(517) 335-7603
GiovanattiN@michigan.gov
BeachB@michigan.gov

Attorneys for the State of Michigan

AARON D. FORD
Attorney General for the State of Nevada

By: /s/ Heidi Parry Stern
Heidi Parry Stern*
Solicitor General
Office of the Nevada Attorney General
1 State of Nevada Way, Ste. 100
Las Vegas, NV 89119
HStern@ag.nv.gov

Attorney for the State of Nevada

Solicitor General
425 Queen Street
Honolulu, HI 96813
(808) 586-1360
david.d.day@hawaii.gov
kaliko.d.fernandes@hawaii.gov

Attorneys for Plaintiff State of Hawai'i

AARON M. FREY
Attorney General for the State of Maine

By: /s/ Brendan Kreckel
Brendan Kreckel*
By: /s/ Kristin Trabucchi
Kristin Trabucchi*
Assistant Attorneys General
Office of the Attorney General
6 State House Station
Augusta, ME 04333-0006
Tel.: 207-626-8800
Fax: 207-287-3145
Brendan.kreckel@maine.gov
kristin.k.trabucchi@maine.gov

Attorneys for the State of Maine

ANDREA JOY CAMPBELL
Attorney General of Massachusetts

By: /s/ David Ureña
Katherine Dirks
Chief State Trial Counsel
Ethan W. Marks*
David Ureña*
Brett M. Gannon*
Assistant Attorneys General
Office of the Massachusetts Attorney
General
1 Ashburton Place Boston, MA 02108
(617) 963-2675
david.urena@mass.gov

*Attorneys for the Commonwealth of
Massachusetts*

RAÚL TORREZ

Attorney General for the State of New Mexico

By: /s/ Mark Noferi

Mark Noferi*
Senior Litigation Counsel
NM Department of Justice
408 Galisteo Street
Santa Fe, New Mexico 87501
(505) 490-4060
MNoferi@nmdoj.gov

Attorney for the State of New Mexico

CHARITY R. CLARK

Attorney General for the State of Vermont

By: /s/ Ryan P. Kane

Ryan P. Kane*
Deputy Solicitor General
109 State Street
Montpelier, VT 05609
(802) 828-2153
Ryan.kane@vermont.gov

Attorney for the State of Vermont

JOSHUA L. KAUL

Attorney General for the State of Wisconsin

By: /s/ Faye B. Hipsman

Faye B. Hipsman*
Assistant Attorney General
Wisconsin Department of Justice
Post Office Box 7857
Madison, Wisconsin 53707-7857
608-264-9487
faye.hipsman@wisdoj.gov

Attorney for the State of Wisconsin

KEITH ELLISON

Attorney General for the State of Minnesota

By: /s/ Joseph R. Richie

Joseph R. Richie*
Special Counsel
445 Minnesota Street, Suite 1400
St. Paul, Minnesota, 55101
(651) 300-0921
joseph.richie@ag.state.mn.us

Attorney for the State of Minnesota

MATTHEW J. PLATKIN

Attorney General of New Jersey

By: /s/ Meghan Musso

Meghan Musso*
Patrick Clancey*
Kathleen Riley*
Deputy Attorneys General
Office of the Attorney General
25 Market Street
Trenton, NJ 08625
(609) 696-5289
meghan.musso@law.njoag.gov

Attorneys for the State of New Jersey

DAN RAYFIELD

Attorney General for the State of Oregon

By: /s/ Coby Howell

Coby Howell*
Senior Assistant Attorney General
Tel (971) 673-1880
Fax (971) 673-5000
coby.howell@doj.oregon.gov

Attorney for the State of Oregon

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on December 10, 2025, I electronically filed the foregoing with the Clerk of the Court for the United States Court of Appeals for the First Circuit by using the appellate CM/ECF system. Participants in the case are represented by registered CM/ECF users, and service will be accomplished by the appellate CM/ECF system.

/s/ Andrew M. Bernie